

## یادداشت‌ها

### ۱. اهمیت تحریف ترجیحات

۱. برخی از عوامل مرتبط با تحریف ترجیح در اینجا وزن‌دهی شده‌اند:

Sissela Bok, *Lying: Moral Choice in Public and Private Life* (New York: Pantheon, 1978), especially chap. 16; and Bok, *Secrets: On the Ethics of Concealment and Revelation* (New York: Pantheon, 1983).

2. Cecil Roth, *A History of the Marranos*, 4th ed. (New York: Hermon Press, 1974), chaps. 1-2.

همچنین نگاه کنید به:

Perez Zagorin, *Ways of Lying: Dissimulation, Persecution, and Conformity in Early Modern Europe* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1990), chap. 3.

3. Zagorin, *Ways of Lying*, chap. 7. Quotations at pp. 137-138.

4. Nikki Keddie, "Symbol and Sincerity in Islam," *Studia Islamica*, 27-63: (1963) 19, especially pp. 51-52.

5. Gustave E. von Grunebaum, *Medieval Islam: A Study in Cultural Orientation*, 2nd ed. (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1953), pp. 191, 354.

ع به عنوان مثال نگاه کنید به:

'Allamah Sayyid Muhammed Husayn Tabataba'i, *Shi'ite Islam*, trans. and ed. Seyyed Hossein Nasr (Albany, N.Y.: SUNY Press, 1975), pp. 223-225.

برای شرح کلی در خصوص گرایش‌های مدرن نگاه کنید به:

Hamid Enayat, *Modern Islamic Political Thought* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1982), pp. 175-181; and Abdulaziz A. Sachedina, "Activist Shi'ism in Iran, Iraq, and Lebanon," in *Fundamentalisms Observed*, ed. Martin E. Marty and R. Scott Appleby (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1991), pp. 403-456, especially pp. 433-437.

7. Mohammed Heikal, *Iran: The Untold Story* (New York: Pantheon, 1982; British ed., 1981), p. 86.

8. Bernard Lewis, *The Emergence of Modern Turkey*, 2nd ed. (London: Oxford University Press, 1968), pp. 401-424; and Binnaz Toprak, *Islam and Political Development in Turkey* (Leiden: E. J. Brill,

1981), chaps. 1-2.

9. Betty Cuniberti, "The Fine Art of the D.C. Newsleak," *Los Angeles Times*, August 9, 1987, pt. 6, pp. 1, 10-11.

10. Stephen Hess, *The Government/Press Connection: Press Officers and Their Offices* (Washington, D.C.: Brookings Institution, 1984), pp. 78-81.

فصل هفتم کتاب هس اختصاصاً به «نشت اطلاعات و دیگر روابط غیررسمی» اختصاص دارد.

11. David A. Gergen, "Secrecy Means Big Things Get Little Thought," *Los Angeles Times*, November 27, 1986, pt. 2, p. 7.

12. Niccolo Machiavelli, *The Prince*, trans. and ed. Thomas G. Bergin (Northbrook, Ill.: AHM Publishing, 1947; orig. Italian ed., 1532).

13. William B. Quandt, *Camp David: Peacemaking and Politics* (Washington, D.C.: Brookings Institution, 1986), especially p. 219.

۱۴. در اغلب شرایط، باید توجه شود که پیامدهای اجتماعی می‌توانند بسیار سریع‌تر از ویژگی‌های شخصی تأثیرگذار بر تصمیمات فردی، تغییر کنند. اگر در مراحل اولیه یک تحقیق لازم باشد چیزی ثابت در نظر گرفته شود، بهتر است آنچه باشد که در واقع تاحدی پایدار است. نگاه کنید به: Ekkehart Schlicht, *Isolation and Aggregation in Economics* (Berlin: Springer-Verlag, 1985), especially chap. 2.

## ۲. ترجیحات نهان و آشکار

۱. مطلب اصلی در اینجا توسط جیمز م. بوچانان و گوردون تالاک بسط داده شده است:  
James M. Buchanan and Gordon Tullock, *The Calculus of Consent: Logical Foundations of Constitutional Democracy* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1962), pt. 2.
2. Amartya Sen, "The Impossibility of a Paretian Liberal," *Journal of Political Economy*, 78 (January/February 1970): 152-157; and Sen, "Liberty, Unanimity, and Rights," *Economica*, 43 (August 1976): 217-245 .  
همچنین نگاه کنید به:  
James M. Buchanan, "Politics and Meddlesome Preferences," in *Smoking and Society: Toward a More Balanced Assessment*, ed. Robert D. Tollison (Lexington, Mass.: Lexington Books, 1985), pp. 335-342.
3. Hannah Arendt, *The Human Condition* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1958), especially pt. 2.
4. Jerome H. Barkow, Leda Cosmides, and John Tooby, eds., *The Adapted Mind: Evolutionary Psychology and the Generation of Culture* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1992), especially pts. 1-3, 8.
5. Jerome H. Barkow, "Beneath New Culture Is Old Psychology: Gossip and Social Stratification," in Barkow, Cosmides, and Tooby, *Adapted Mind*, pp. 627-637.
6. F. A. Hayek, *The Fatal Conceit: The Errors of Socialism* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1989; orig. pub., 1988); and James M. Buchanan, *The Economics and the Ethics of Constitutional Order* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1991).
7. Barkow, "Beneath New Culture Is Old Psychology"
8. Erving Goffman, *The Presentation of Self in Everyday Life* (Woodstock, N.Y.: Overlook Press, 1973; orig. ed., 1959).
۹. پیشگامان این تحقیق بدین قرارند:  
Gabriel Tarde, *The Laws of Imitation*, trans. Elsie C. Parsons (New York: Henry Holt, 1903; first French ed., 1890); and Gustave Le Bon, *The Crowd: A Study of the Popular Mind* (Atlanta: Cherokee Publishing Co., 1982; first French ed., 1895 ).  
برای بررسی انتقادی تمام ادبیات موضوع نگاه کنید به:  
Serge Moscovici, "Social Influence and Conformity," in *The Handbook of Social Psychology*, 3rd ed., vol. 2, ed. Gardner Lindzey and Elliot Aronson (New York: Random House, 1985), pp. 347-412.

۱۰. از بین این مطالعات اولیه، برجسته‌ترین آنها این است:

Muzafer Sherif, "A Study of Some Social Factors in Perception," *Archives of Psychology*, 27, no. 187 (1935).

11. Solomon E. Asch, "effects of group pressure upon the Modification and Distribution of Judgements," in *Groups, Leadership and Men*, ed. Harold Guetzkow (New York: Russel and Russel, 1963Y first ed., 1951), pp.177-190. Further details may be found in Asch, "Studies of Independence and Conformity: I. A Minority of One against a Unanimous Majority," *Psychological Monographs*, 70, no. 416 (1956).

12. Morton Deutsch and Harold B. Gerard, "A Study of Normative and Informational Social Influences upon Individual Judgment," *journal of Abnormal and Social Psychology*, 51 (November 1955): 629-636.

13. Lee Ross, Gunter Bierbrauer, and Susan Hoffman, "The Role of Attribution Processes in Conformity and Dissent: Revisiting the Asch Situation," *American Psychologist*, 31 (February 1976): 148-157.

14. James E. Dittes and Harold H. Kelley, "Effects of Different Conditions of Acceptance upon Conformity to Group Norms," *Journal of Abnormal and Social Psychology*, 53 (July 1956): 100-107; Michael Argyle, "Social Pressure in Public and Private Situations," *Journal of Abnormal and Social Psychology*, 54 (March 1957): 172-175; and Bertram H. Raven, "Social Influence on Opinions and the Communication of Related Content," *journal of Abnormal and Social Psychology*, 58 (January 1959): 119-128.

15. Jerry B. Harvey, *The Abilene Paradox and Other Meditations in Management* (Lexington, Mass.: Lexington Books, 1988), chap. 7.

16. Stanley Milgram, *Obedience to Authority: An Experimental View* (New York: Harper & Row, 1974), chaps. 2-3.

این آزمایش در سال‌های ۱۹۶۳-۱۹۶۰ انجام شد.

17. Ibid., pp. 32-43, 59-62.

18. Richard I. Borden, "Audience Influence," in *Psychology of Group Influence*, ed. Paul K Paulus (Hillsdale, N.J.: Lawrence Erlbaum, 1980), pp. 99-131.

19. Kurt W. Back and Morton D. Bogdanoff, "Plasma Lipid Responses to Leadership, Conformity, and Deviation," in *Psychobiological Approaches to Social Behavior*, ed. P. Herbert Leiderman and David Shapiro (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1964), pp. 24-42.

۲۰. این مبحث مشابه مشاهده‌ای است که در اینجا مدنظر قرار گرفته است: Anthony Downs, *An Economic Theory of Democracy* (New York: Harper & Row, 1957), مبنی بر اینکه بعید است یک رأی نتیجه یک انتخابات ملی را تغییر دهد. داونز با نشان دادن این ادامه می‌دهد که رأی‌دهندگان انگیزه کمی برای رأی دادن دارند. صرف‌نظر از این معما که مردم به هر حال رأی می‌دهند، من مایلیم به این موضوع اشاره کنم که درحالی که انتخابات ملی هر چند وقت یکبار برگزار می‌شود، در فاصله میان این انتخابات، افراد به‌طور معمول در پاسخ به فشارهای اجتماعی ترجیحاتشان را درباره گستره وسیعی از موضوعات آشکار می‌کنند.

21. Asch, "Effects of Group Pressure," pp. 185-187.
22. Milgram, *Obedience to Authority*, pp. 116-121.
23. Ronald Friend, Yvonne Rafferty, and Dana Bramel, "A Puzzling Misinterpretation of the Asch 'Conformity' Study," *European Journal of Social Psychology*, 20 (January-February 1990): 29-44.
24. Jon Elster, *Sour Grapes: Studies in the Subversion of Rationality* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983), p. 67.
25. Sigmund Freud, *The Ego and the Id*, trans. James Strachey (New York: W. W. Norton, 1961; first German ed., 1923); Gordon W. Allport, *Personality: A Psychological Interpretation* (New York: Henry Holt, 1937); Erich Fromm, *Man for Himself: An Inquiry into the Psychology -of Ethics* (New York: Fawcett Premier, 1975; first ed., 1947); and Abraham H. Maslow, *Motivation and Personality*, 3rd ed. (New York: Harper & Row, 1987; first ed., 1954), especially chaps. 11-13.
26. Sigmund Freud, *Civilization and Its Discontents*, trans. James Strachey (New York: W. W. Norton, 1961; first German ed., 1930).
27. For much evidence, see Karen Homey, *Neurosis and Human Growth: The Struggle toward Self-Realization* (New York: W. W. Norton, 1950).
28. Richard Totman, *Social Causes of Illness* (New York: Pantheon, 1979).

۲۹. به عنوان مثال نگاه کنید به: Yaşar Kemal, *Memed My Hawk*, trans. Edouard Roditi (New York: Pantheon, 1961; orig. Turkish ed., 1955).

۳۰. برای دو اظهار نظر درباره این تأثیر، یکی توسط یک اقتصاددان و دیگری توسط یک جامعه‌شناس، نگاه کنید به:

Gary Becker, *The Economic Approach to Human Behavior* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1976), especially pt. 1; and John F. Scott, *Internalization of*

*Norms: A Sociological Theory of Moral Commitment* (Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, 1971), especially pp. 35-3. I was led to the latter reference by Barrington Moore, Jr., *Injustice: The Social Bases of Obedience and Revolt* (White Plains, N.Y.: M. E. Sharpe, 1978), p. 102.

مور در صفحات ۸۹-۱۰۸ این کتاب، تحلیلی روشن از «استقلال اخلاقی» ارائه می‌کند. مفهومی مرتبط با آنچه من به عنوان خودبیانی معرفی کردم. تحلیل او مکمل بحث حاضر است.

۳۱. برای مطالعه تکمیلی در این خصوص، نگاه کنید به:

James Q. Wilson, *The Moral Sense* (New York: Free Press, 1993), especially chaps. 1, 10.

32. H. G. Creel, *Confucius and the Chinese Way* (New York: Harper Torchbooks, 1960; orig. ed., 1949), p. 130.

۳۳. برای ثبت جبری این موضوع  $U$  را معادل فایده مجموع، و  $R$  و  $I$  را سه جزء آن در نظر می‌گیریم. با توجه به این نمادگذاری،  $U=I+R+E$ . نخستین جزء، یعنی فایده ذاتی، وابسته به تصمیم جامعه، یعنی  $d$ ، است. در مقابل، تصمیم جامعه نیز تابعی از ترجیح عیان خود فرد، یعنی  $y$ ، و ترجیح عیان همه بقیه افراد، یعنی  $-y$ ، است. بدین ترتیب  $I=I(d)$  در جایی که  $d=d(y,y)$ . جزء دوم فایده مجموع، یعنی فایده اعتباری، به سادگی وابسته به انتخاب ترجیح عیان فرد است:  $R=R(y)$ . سرانجام فایده بیانی وابسته است به اختلاف میان ترجیحات عیان و نهان افراد:  $E=E(x,y)$

۳۴.  $R$  می‌تواند دارای حالت‌های مختلف و ناپیوستگی‌هایی باشد، که در شرایط وجود گروه‌های فشار مختلف کاملاً نیز محتمل است. به این احتمالات در فصول آینده خواهیم پرداخت.

35. Robert H. Frank, *Passions within Reason: The Strategic Role of the Emotions* (New York: W. W. Norton, 1988).

36. Goffman, *Presentation of Self*. See also Robert J. Edelman, *The Psychology of Embarrassment* (Chichester, U.K.: John Wiley, 1987).

37. Maureen Dowd, "Masters of the Sound Bite Cede Match to Gorbachev," *New York Times*, June 2, 1990, p. 5.

38. Fred E. Karch, "Blushing," *Psychoanalytic Review*, 58 (Spring 1971): 37-50. See also Edelman, *The Psychology of Embarrassment*, especially chaps. 4, 6; and Gershen Kaufman, *The Psychology of Shame: Theory and Treatment of Shame-Based Syndromes* (New York: Springer Publishing Co., 1989), pt. 1.

39. *Economist*, December 23, 1989, p. 55.

40. Cited by Perez Zagorin, *Ways of Lying: Dissimulation, Persecution, and Con-*

- formity in Early Modern Europe* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1990), p. 8.
41. Herbert A. Simon, "Rational Choice and the Structure of the Environment," *Psychological Review*, 63 (March 1956): 129-138; and Simon, *Reason in Human Affairs* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1983).
۴۲. نقدی آموزنده از این مفهوم اینجا ارائه شده است:  
G. Peter Penz, *Consumer Sovereignty and Human Interests* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1986).
- این باور که تصمیم‌گیران حاکم مطلق هستند، مبنای اصل «ترجیح ابرازشده» است که بسیاری از محققان برای استنتاج ترجیحات نهان فرد از کنش‌های فردی از آن استفاده می‌کنند. در پس‌زمینه‌هایی که فایده‌اعتباری مهم است، کنش‌های فردی تأثیر مجموع چندین عامل را «فاش» می‌کنند. و مزیت‌های اعتباری تحریف ترجیح ممکن است کاملاً مزایای آشکار کردن ترجیح نهان را از میان ببرد.
43. Harvey Leibenstein, "Bandwagon, Snob, and Veblen Effects in the Theory of Consumers' Demand," *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 64 (May 1950): 183-207; and Robert H. Frank, *Choosing the Right Pond: Human Behavior and the Quest for Status* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1985).
44. Albert O. Hirschman, *Exit, Voice, and Loyalty: Responses to Decline in Firms, Organizations, and States* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1970).
45. Plato, *The Republic*, trans. Francis M. Cornford (New York: Oxford University Press, 1945; first Greek ed., 4th c. B.C.E.), chap. 13.
46. Adam Smith, *A Theory of Moral Sentiments* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1976; first ed., 1759), especially pt. 3, chap. 3. Modern treatments of Smith's two-way decomposition are offered by Howard Margolis, *Selfishness, Altruism, and Rationality* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1982); and Geoffrey Brennan and Loren Lomasky, "The Impartial Spectator Goes to Washington: Toward a Smithian Theory of Electoral Behavior," *Economics and Philosophy*, 1 (October 1985): 189-211.
47. Immanuel Kant, *Groundwork of the Metaphysics of Morals*, trans. H. J. Paton as *The Moral Law* (New York: Barnes and Noble, 1950; first German ed., 1785), especially chap. 2.
48. Sigmund Freud, *Beyond the Pleasure Principle*, trans. James Strachey (New York: W. W. Norton, 1961; first German ed., 1922). The id, wholly unconscious, embodies the individual's selfish impulses. The ego, wholly conscious, is his in-

strument of learning and adaptation. The partly subconscious superego constitutes his conscience.

49. Jon Elster, *Ulysses and the Sirens: Studies in Rationality and Irrationality* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1979); and Thomas Schelling, *Choice and Consequence: The Perspectives of an Errant Economist* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1984), especially essays 2-4 .
50. Stuart Hampshire, *Morality and Conflict* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1983).
51. As quoted by Marshall G. S. Hodgson, *The Venture of Islam: Conscience and History in a World Civilization*, vol. 1: *The Classical Age of 'Islam* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1974), p. 401.



### ۳. نقطه نظر شخصی، افکار عمومی

۱. اصطلاح مذکور از اینجا می‌آید:

1. Stephen Hilgartner and Charles L. Bosk, "The Rise and Fall of social Problems: A Public Arenas Model," *American Journal of Sociology*, 94 (July 1988): 53-78.  
این مقاله شامل دیدگاه‌های مفیدی در خصوص تحول برنامه کار سیاسی است.
2. Giovanni Sartori, *Democratic Theory* (Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 1962; Italian ed., 1958), pp. 252-257.
3. Edward G. Carmines and James A. Stimson, *Issue Evolution: Race and the Transformation of American Politics* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1989), p. 5.
4. Norbert Elias, *The Civilizing Process*, vol. 1: *The History of Manners* and vol. 2: *Power and Civility*, trans. Edmund Jephcott (New York: Pantheon, 1982; German ed., 1939).
5. John Zaller and Stanley Feldman, "A Simple Theory of the Survey Response: Questions versus Revealing Preferences," *American Journal of Political Science*, 36 (August 1992): 579-616.
6. Mancur Olson, *The Logic of Collective Action: Public Goods and the Theory of Groups* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press; 1965).
7. George J. Stigler, "Free Riders and Collective Action: An Appendix to Theories of Economic Regulation," *Bell Journal of Economic and Management Science*, 5 (Autumn 1974): 359-365.

۸. برای توضیحات بیشتر و نقد آگاهانه کل منبع، نگاه کنید به:

- Russell Hardin, *Collective Action* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1982); Todd Sandler, *Collective Action: Theory and Applications* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1992); and Mark I. Lichbach, *The Coopemtor's Dilemma* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1995).
9. Gerald Marwell and Ruth E. Ames, "Economists Free Ride, Does Anyone Else?: Experiments on the Provision of Public Goods, IV," *Journal of Public Economics*, 15 (June 1981): 295-310; and Robyn M. Dawes, "Social Dilemmas, Economic Self-Interest, and Evolutionary Theory," in *Frontiers of Mathematical Psychology: Essays in Honor of Clyde Coomhs*, ed. Donald R. Brown and J. E. Keith Smith (New York: Springer Verlag, 1991): 53-79. For insightful interpretations of such

experiments, see Robert H. Frank, *Passions within Reason: The Strategic Role of the Emotions* (New York: W. W. Norton, 1988); and James Q. Wilson, *The Moral Sense* (New York: Free Press, 1993).

10. R. Mark Isaac, Kenneth F. McCue, and Charles R. Plott, "Public Goods Provision in an Experimental Environment," *Journal of Public Economics*, 26 (February 1985): 51-74; and R. Mark Isaac and James M. Walker, "Communication and Free-Riding Behavior: The Voluntary Contribution Mechanism," *Economic Inquiry*, 26 (October 1988): 585-608 .
11. Steven E. Finkel, Edward N. Muller, and Karl-Dieter Opp, "Personal Influence, Collective Rationality, and Mass Political Action," *American Political Science Review*, 83 (September 1989): 885-903.

۱۲. برای مشاهده تلاشی برای حل این معما نگاه کنید به:

Albert O. Hirschman, *Shifting Involvements: Private Interest and Public Action* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1982).

13. Finkel, Muller, and Opp, "Personal Influence."
14. W. Russell Neuman, *The Paradox of Mass Politics: Knowledge and Opinion in the American Electorate* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1986).
15. James Madison, "The Federalist no. 10" (1787), in *The Federalist*, ed. Jacob E. Cooke (Middletown, Conn.: Wesleyan University Press, 1961), p. 57.
16. Laurence H. Tribe, *Abortion: The Clash of Absolutes* (New York: W. W. Norton, 1990).

۱۷. نکته آخر و برخی دیگر از این موارد در اینجا بسط داده شده است:

Bernard Manin, "On Legitimacy and Political Deliberation," trans. Elly Stein and Jane Mansbridge, *Political Theory*, 15 (August 1987): 355-357 (French ed., 1985).

دیدگاه‌های دیگری نیز در اینجا ارائه شده است:

- Michael Hechter, *Principles of Group Solidarity* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1987).
18. David B. Truman, *The Governmental Process: Political Interests and Public Opinion*, 2nd ed. (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1971), especially pt. 1.
  19. Niccolo Machiavelli, *The Prince*, trans. and ed. Thomas G. Bergin (Northbrook, Ill.: AHM Publishing, 1947; orig. Italian ed., 1532), chap. 19.
  20. David Hume, *A Treatise of Human Nature*, ed. L. A. Selby-Bigge (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1896; orig. ed., 1739/1740), p. 39.

۲۱. اصطلاح «باور جمعی» برای بیان اندیشه عمومی به کار می‌رود.

22. Elisabeth Noelle-Neumann, *The Spiral of Silence: Public Opinion-Our Social Skin* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1984; German ed., 1980), p. 97.

23. Gustave Le Ban, *The Crowd: A Study of the Popular Mind* (Atlanta: Cherokee Publishing Co., 1982; first French ed., 1895).

۲۴. برای دو بررسی مهم تاریخی در خصوص این ایده، نگاه کنید به:

Serge Moscovici, *The Age of the Crowd: A Historical Treatise on Mass Psychology*, trans. J. C. Whitehouse (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985; French ed., 1981); and J. S. McClelland, *The Crowd and the Mob: From Plato to Canetti* (London: Unwin Hyman, 1989).

۲۵. به عبارت قراردادی، برای هر فرد غیرفعال  $E(x, x) > \max [R(0), R(100)]$

۲۶. برای ارائه‌ای که چنین تفاوت‌هایی را تأیید می‌کند، نگاه کنید به:

Timur Kuran, "Sparks and Prairie Fires: A Theory of Unanticipated Political Revolution," *Public Choice*, 61 (April 1989): 41-74.

۲۷. انواع مختلفی از این گرایش وجود دارد. برای نمونه‌ای مؤثر نگاه کنید به:

William H. Riker, *The Theory of Political Coalitions* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1962).

#### ۴. پویایی‌های افکار عمومی

1. Pamela Oliver, "Rewards and Punishments as Selective Incentives for Collective Action: Theoretical Investigations," *American Journal of Sociology*, 85 (May 1980): 1356-1375.

۲. من ایده تغییر ضرب‌المثل اصلی برای استفاده آموزشی را از اینجا وام گرفتم:  
Robert Sugden, "Review of *The Economics of Conformism* by Stephen R. G. Jones," *Economic Journal*, 95 (June 1985): 502-504.

3. Perez Zagorin, *Ways of Lying: Dissimulation, Persecution, and Conformity in Early Modern Europe* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1990), p. 42.

4. Intracommunal compliance efforts are explored more fully by Douglas Heckathorn, "Collective Sanctions and Compliance Norms: A Formal Theory of Group-Mediated Social Control," *American Sociological Review*, 55 (June 1990): 366-384.

۵. دلیلی دیگر برای اینکه گروه بدواً ضعیف‌تر ممکن است بر رقیب قوی‌تر غلبه کند، می‌تواند این باشد که برای سرمایه‌گذاری بیشتر در رقابت تشویق شده باشد. نگاه کنید به:  
Jack Hirshleifer, "The Paradox of Power," *Economics and Politics*, 3 (November 1991): 177-200.

۶. برای یک جامعه  $N$  نفره که اعضایش با اندیس  $i$  مشخص می‌شوند، منحنی انتشار در معادله زیر صدق می‌کند.

۷. به بیان قراردادی، افکار عمومی توسط  $Y=T(Y^*)$  حاصل می‌شود. افکار عمومی هنگامی در حالت تعادل قرار دارد که  $Y=Y^*$  باشد.

8. Alexis de Tocqueville, *Democracy in America*, vol. 1, ed. Henry Reeve, Francis Bowen, and Phillips Bradley (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1989; orig. French ed., 1835), p. 263 (emphasis added).

۹. تعریف من از بی‌ثباتی، تحت تأثیر توصیف کلاسیک آلفرد مارشال است. البته استعاره او متفاوت است. نگاه کنید به نوشته او:  
*Principles of Economics: An Introductory Volume*, 8th ed. (London: Macmillan, 1936), pp. 806-807.

10. Timothy J. Kehoe, "Multiplicity of Equilibria and Comparative Statics," *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 100 (February 1985): 119-147.

۱۱. برای مطالب بیشتر در خصوص عدم تمایل اقتصاددانان به مطالعه تعادل چندگانه، نگاه کنید به:

W. Brian Arthur, "Positive Feedbacks in the Economy," *Scientific American*, 262 (February 1990): 92-99.

۱۲. جریان در موارد متعدد دیگری مورد توجه قرار گرفته است، از جمله رشد گلوله‌برفی، اثر دومینو، اثر گله یا دنباله‌روی و جرم بحرانی. توماس سی شلینگ مقدمه‌ای بسیار خوب در فصل چهارم کتاب *Micromotives and Macrobehavior* (New York: Norton, 1987) ارائه کرده است. منابع مهم از این قرارند:

Mark Granovetter, "Threshold Models of Collective Behavior," *American Journal of Sociology*, 83 (May 1978): 1420-1443;

Stephen R. G. Jones; *The Economics of Conformism* (New York: Basil Blackwell, 1984); Paul David, "Some New Standards for the Economics of Standardization in the Information Age," in *Economic Policy and Technological Performance*, ed. Partha Dasgupta and Paul Stoneman (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1987), pp. 206-239; W. Brian Arthur, "Self-Reinforcing Mechanisms in Economics," in *The Economy as an Evolving Complex System*, ed. Philip W. Anderson, Kenneth J. Arrow, and David Pines (Redwood City, Calif.: Addison-Wesley, 1988), pp. 9-31; Ulrich Witt, "The Evolution of Economic Institutions as a Propagation Process," *Public Choice*, 62 (August 1989): 155-172; James S. Coleman, *Foundations of Social Theory* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1990), chap. 9; and Sushil Bikchandani, David Hirshleifer, and Ivo Welsh, "A Theory of Fads, Fashion, Custom, and Cultural Change as Informational Cascades," *Journal of Political Economy*, 100 (October 1992): 992-1026 .

مدلی که در اینجا مورد توجه قرار گرفته در شکلی ابتدایی‌تر در مقاله زیر مورد اشاره قرار گرفته است: Timur Kuran, "Chameleon Voters and Public Choice," *Public Choice*, (1987) 53 53-78.

13. Pamela Oliver, Gerald Marwell, and Ruy Teixeira, "A Theory of Critical Mass. I. Interdependence, Group Heterogeneity, and the Production of Collective Action," *American Journal of Sociology*, 91 (November 1985): 522-556.

14. V. S. Naipaul, *India: A Wounded Civilization* (New York: Vintage Books, 1978; orig. ed., 1977), p. 146.

15. Catherine Marsh, "Back on the Bandwagon: The Effect of Opinion Polls on Public Opinion," *British Journal of Political Science*, 15 (January 1984): 51-74 .

۱۶. این اصطلاح از اینجا اخذ شده است:

W. Brian Arthur, "Competing Technologies, Increasing Returns, and Lock-In by Historical Events," *Economic Journal*, 99 (March 1989): 119.

۱۷. نگاه کنید به:

Amos Tversky and Daniel Kahneman, "Judgment under Uncertainty: Heuristics and Biases," *Science*, 185 (September 1974): 1124-1131 ; and Richard Nisbett and Lee Ross, *Human Inference: Strategies and Shortcomings of Social Judgment* (Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-1- Iall, 1980), pp. 24-28, 115-122.

۱۸. میان‌بر ذهنی دیگری با عنوان «میان‌بر دسترسی» که در فصل دهم شرح داده می‌شود، در برخی موارد در تناقض با میان‌بر ذهنی همانندی قرار می‌گیرد. رویدادی که برای بسیاری از مشاهده‌کنندگان کم‌اهمیت است، ممکن است توجه بیش‌ازحد از مشاهده‌کننده‌ای را جلب کند که این رویداد برایش برجسته و در نتیجه دردسترس است. گزارشگری که تلاش می‌کند زوال یک شرکت خودروسازی را شرح دهد، به یک تجربه شخصی درباره خودرویش، نسبت به یک گزارش از مصرف‌کنندگان که بر مبنای نمونه‌ای بزرگ تهیه شده، اهمیت بیشتری می‌دهد.

19. Michael Wheeler, *Lies, Damn Lies, and Statistics: The Manipulation of Public Opinion in America* (New York: Liveright, 1976); Robert B. Cialdini, *Influence: How and Why People Agree to Things* (New York: William Morrow, 1984); Benjamin Ginsberg, *The Captive Public: How Mass Opinion Promotes State Power* (New York: Basic Books-, 1986), especially chap. 3; and George F. Bishop, "Manipulation and Control of People's Responses to Public Opinion Polls: An Orwellian Experiment in 1984," in *The Orwellian Moment: Hindsight and Foresight in the Post-1984 World*, ed. Robert L. Savage, James Combs, and Dan Nimmo (Fayetteville: University of Arkansas Press, 1989), pp. 119-129.

20. Eugene Borgida and Richard E. Nisbett, "The Differential Impact of Abstract vs. Concrete Information on Decisions," *Journal of Applied Social Psychology*, 7 (July-September 1977): 258-271. For other relevant experiments, see Daniel Kahneman and Amos Tversky, "Subjective Probability: A Judgment of Representativeness," *Cognitive Psychology*, 3 (July 1972): 430-454.

۲۱. نگاه کنید به: Nisbett and Ross, *Human Inference*, chap. ۴.

۲۲. این مفهوم تحت اصطلاح «احساس فراگیری» در اینجا معرفی شده است: Henry Allport, *Social Psychology* (Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1924), pp. 305-309. The term "pluralistic ignorance" was first used by Richard Louis Schanck, "A Study of a Community and Its Groups and Institutions Conceived of as Behavior of Individuals," *Psychological Monographs*, 43-2 (1932): 101.

23. Hubert J. O'Gorman, "Pluralistic Ignorance and White Estimates of White Support for Racial Segregation," *Public Opinion Quarterly*, 39 (Fall 1975): 313-330. See also Hubert J. O'Gorman with Stephen L. Garry, "Pluralistic Ignorance-A Repli-

- cation and Extension,” *Public Opinion Quarterly*, 40 (Winter 1976-77): 449-458.
24. Gunnar Myrdal, *Against the Stream: Critical Essays on Economics* (New York: Pantheon, 1973), p. 303.
25. Detlev J. K. Peukert, *Inside Nazi Germany: Conformity, -opposition, and Racism in Everyday Life*, trans. Richard Deveson (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1987; German ed., 1982), p. 239.
26. Bella M. DePaulo, Miron Zuckerman, and Robert Rosenthal, “Humans as Lie Detectors,” *Journal of Communication*, 30 (Spring 1980): 129-139; and Zuckerman, DePaulo, and Rosenthal, “Verbal and Nonverbal Communication of Deception,” in *Advances in Experimental Social Psychology*, vol. 14, ed. Leonard Berkowitz (New York: Academic Press, 1981), pp. 1-59.
- برای تفسیر این گواه به منبع زیر مراجعه کنید:  
Robert H. Frank, *Passions within Reason: The Strategic Role of the Emotions* (New York: W. W. Norton, 1988), chap. 7.
27. Arthur G. Miller, Barry Gillen, Charles Schenker, and Shirley Radlove, “Perception of Obedience to Authority,” *Proceedings of the 81<sup>st</sup> Annual Convention of the American Psychological Association*, 8, pt. 1127-128: (1973) .
۲۸. این آزمایش در اوایل دهه ۱۹۷۰ توسط جینتر بایربرایر انجام شده و در اینجا شرح داده شده است:  
Nisbett and Ross, *Human Inference*, pp. 121-122.
29. Lee Ross, “The Intuitive Psychologist and His Shortcomings,” in *Advances in Experimental Social Psychology*, vol. 10, ed. Leonard Berkowitz (New York: Academic Press, 1977), pp. 173-220.
- برای بررسی پژوهش مربوطه نگاه کنید به:  
Michael Ross and Garth O. Fletcher, “Attribution and Social Perception,” in *The Handbook of Social Psychology*, 3<sup>rd</sup> ed., vol. 2, ed. Gardner Lindzey and Elliott Aronson (New York: Random House, 1985), pp. 73-122.
۳۰. برای آشنایی با گزاره‌ای مؤثر در این رابطه به منبع زیر مراجعه کنید:  
Harold H. Kelley, “Attribution Theory in Social Psychology,” in *Nebraska Symposium on Motivation*, ed. David Levine (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1967), pp. 192-238.
- نظریه کلی با جزئیات بیشتر اینجا شرح داده شده است:  
Ross and Fletcher, “Attribution and Social Perception.” The foundations for Kelley’s theory were laid by Fritz Heider, *The Psychology of Interpersonal Relations* (New York: Wiley, 1958).

## ۵. منابع نهادی تحریف ترجیح

۱. برای اطلاع از تمایزات معمول بیشتر نگاه کنید به:

Giovanni Sartori, *The Theory of Democracy Revisited* (Chatham, N.J.: Chatham House Publishers, 1987), chap. 2.

2. Frank R. Strong, "Fifty Years of 'Clear and Present Danger': From Schenck to Brandenburg-and Beyond" (1969), in *Free Speech and Association: The Supreme Court and the First Amendment*, ed. Philip B. Kurland (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1975), pp. 302-341.

3. Samuel A. Stouffer, *Communism, Conformity, and Civil Liberties: A Cross-Section of the Nation Speaks Its Mind* (Garden City, N.Y.: Doubleday, 1955), pp. 39-46. Many other surveys offered similar results. For an overview, see Herbert McClosky and Alida Brill, *Dimensions of Tolerance: What Americans Believe about Civil Liberties* (New York: Russell Sage, 1983), pp. 74-77.

4. Clyde Z. Nunn, Harry J. Crockett, Jr., and J. Alien Williams, Jr., *Tolerance for Nonconformity* (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1978), p. 43.

فصل سوم این کتاب شامل داده‌های بیشتری است. همچنین نگاه کنید به:

John Mueller, "Trends in Political Tolerance," *Public Opinion Quarterly*, 52 (Spring 1988): 1-25.

5. McClosky and Brill, *Dimensions of Tolerance*, pp. 54-56, 62-64.

6. Herbert McClosky and John Zaller, *The American Ethos: Public Attitudes toward Capitalism and Democracy* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1984), pp. 36-37.

7. McClosky and Brill, *Dimensions of Tolerance*, p. 82.

8. Nat Hentoff, *Free Speech for Me-But Not for Thee: How the American Left and Right Relentlessly Censor Each Other* (New York: HarperCollins, 1992).

۹. برای مطالعه گزارشی درباره مخالفت فمینیستی با پورنوگرافی، مراجعه کنید به:

Donald Alexander Downs, *The New Politics of Pornography* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1989); and Ronald Dworkin, "Two Concepts of Liberty," in *Isaiah Berlin: A Celebration*, ed. Edna and Avishai Margalit (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1991), pp. 100-109. Alexis de Tocqueville, *Democracy in America*, ed. Henry Reeve, Francis Bowen, and Phillips Bradley, 2 vols. (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1989; first French ed., 1835), especially vol. 1, pp. 254-270, and vol. 2, pp. 316-321.



11. John Stuart Mill, *On Liberty* (Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing Co., 1978; orig. ed., 1859), especially chap. 4.
12. Douglas Maurice MacDowell, *The Oxford Classical Dictionary*, 2nd ed., ed. N. G. L. Hammond and H. H. Scullard (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1970), pp. 762-763; and M. I. Finley, *Politics in the Ancient World* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983), pp. 53-55.
13. Paul L. Montgomery, "French Students Teach Chirac on the Streets," *Los Angeles Times*, December 14, 1986, p. V-2.
14. Maura Dolan, "Reagan Record on Parks Gets Mixed Marks," *Los Angeles Times*, June 21, 1988, pp. 1, 3, 19.
۱۵. نکته آخر توسط چارلز لیندبلوم در اینجا ارائه شده است:  
Charles E. Lindblom, *Politics and Markets: The World's Political-Economic Systems* (New York: Basic Books, 1977), chap. 9.
16. Robert A. Dahl, *A Preface to Democratic Theory* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1956), p. 125.
۱۷. مشاهده اینکه رقابت الکترونیکی فهرست انتخابات‌های محدودی را در اختیار افراد قرار می‌دهد، در بطن ادبیاتی قرار دارد که آغازگر آن هارولد هاتلینگ بود:  
Harold Hotelling, "Stability in Competition," *Economic journal*, 39 (March 1929): 41-57,  
و توسط آنتونی داوونز جا افتاده است:  
Anthony Downs, *An Economic Theory of Democracy* (New York: Harper & Row, 1957).
- این نظریه به‌گونه‌ای پالایش شده تا عواملی که موجب می‌شوند برنامه‌های انتخاباتی رقبا کاملاً شبیه به یکدیگر نشوند را نیز در خود جای دهد. به‌عنوان مثال نگاه کنید به:  
James S. Coleman, "Internal Processes Governing Party Positions in Elections," *Public Choice*, 11 (Fall 1971): 35-60.
18. Alexis de Tocqueville, *The Old Regime and the French Revolution*, trans. Stuart Gilbert (Garden City, N.Y.: Doubleday, 1955; orig. French ed., 1856), p. xi.
19. *New York Times*, January 6, 1989, p. A13.
20. Carole Pateman, *Participation and Democratic Theory* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1970), chap. 2.
۲۱. حتی اگر نزدیک بود، تعدادی کافی از افراد علنی بودن رأی‌گیری را درخواست می‌کردند.

22. Shaul Bakhash, "The Politics of Land, Law, and Social Justice in Iran," *Middle East Journal*, 43 (Spring 1989): 186-201.
23. Julius G. German, Stephen B. Goldberg, and Jeanne B. Herman, *Union Representation Elections: Law and Reality* (New York: Russell Sage, 1976), especially chap. 6.
24. John Stuart Mill, *Representative Government* (London: Longmans, Green, and Co., 1919; orig. ed., 1861), p. 81.
25. Mill, *On Liberty*, chap. 4.
26. Mill, *Representative Government*, pp. 84-85.
۲۷. این نکته توسط آلن رایان نیز تدوین شده است:  
Alan Ryan, "Two Concepts of Politics and Democracy: James and John Stuart Mill," in *Machiavelli and the Nature of Political Thought*, ed. Martin Fleisher (New York: Atheneum, 1972), sect. 3.
۲۸. برای تفصیل بیشتر نگاه کنید به:  
Preston King, *Toleration* (New York: St. Martin's Press, 1976), chap. 1.
29. Jose Ortega y Gasset, *The Revolt of the Masses*, trans. Anthony Kerrigan (Notre Dame, Ind.: University of Notre Dame Press, 1985; orig. Spanish ed., 1929), p. 65.
30. McClosky and Brill, *Dimensions of Tolerance*, p. 16.
۳۱. این مبحث توسط دانک وارت تدوین و از راه مشاهده اثبات شده است:  
Dank wart A. Rustow, "Transitions to Democracy: Toward a Dynamic Model," *Comparative Politics*, 2 (April 1970): 337-363.
- یک متغیر تأثیرگذار این مبحث را در اینجا می‌توانید مطالعه کنید:  
Bernard Crick, *In Defense of Politics*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1972), especially chap. 1.
32. Perry Miller, *Errand into the Wilderness* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1956), pp. 143-144. By way of McClosky and Zaller, *The American Ethos*, p. 22.
۳۳. برای مطالعه شواهدی در اثبات این تفسیر نگاه کنید به:  
J. Boorstin, *The Americans: The Colonial Experience* (New York: Random House, 1958), pts. 1-4.
34. James Madison, "The Federalist no. 51" (1788), in *The Federalist*, ed. Jacob E. Cooke (Middletown, Conn.: Wesleyan University Press, 1961), p. 349.

راهبرد مدیسنی در اینجا مورد بحث و نقد قرار گرفته است.

Dahl, *A Preface to Democratic Theory*, especially chap. 1.

35. Sartori, *The Theory of Democracy Revisited*, p. 90.

36. Hugh Roberts, "From Radical Mission to Equivocal Ambition: The Expansion and Manipulation of Algerian Islamism, 1979-1992," in *Accounting for Fundamentalisms: The Dynamic Character of Movements*, ed. Martin E. Marty and R. Scott Appleby (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1994), pp. 428-489.

## ۶. محافظه‌کاری جمعی

۱. این موضوع در بررسی آثاری به شرح زیر، مطرح شده است:  
 Timur Kurim, "The Tenacious Past: Theories of Personal and Collective Conservatism," *Journal of Economic Behavior and Organization*, 10 (September 1988):143-171 ;  
 Paul A. David, "Path Dependence: Putting the Past in the Future of Economics," Institute for Mathematical Studies in the Social Sciences Technical Report no. 533, Stanford University, November 1988.
2. Albert O. Hirschman, *Exit, Voice, and Loyalty: Responses to Decline in Firms, Organizations, and States* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1970).
3. Mancur Olson, *The Rise and Decline of Nations: Economic Growth, Stagflation, and Social Rigidities* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1982).
۴. در نظر گرفتن امکان مساوی برای تمامی احتمالات، امری اختیاری است، اما این کار در غیاب منطق و استدلالی برای شناسایی تفاوت‌ها چنین کاری معقول می‌نماید. همچنین دیگر مزیت آن روشن کردن فرضیات در نظر گرفته شده است.
۵. به‌طور رسمی این معیار می‌تواند اینگونه تعریف شود.  $Y$  را معادل تعادل مستقر و  $y-h$  را میانگین افکار عمومی در غیاب حافظه در نظر بگیرید. در این نشان‌گذاری، نقش سابقه در شرایط پایداری  $Y$  اینگونه به‌دست می‌آید:
- $$C(Y^*) = IY^* - Y^{hlf}I/(Y^{max} - Y^{min})$$
- که در آن مخرج بیانگر اختلاف میان حداقل و حداکثر مقادیر ممکن میانگین ارزش‌های افکار عمومی است. برای مشاهده دو معیار مرتبط نگاه کنید به:  
 see Timur Kuran, "Preference Falsification, Policy Continuity, and Collective Conservatism," *Economic Journal*, 97 (September 1987): 642-665.
۶. به زبان ریاضی، تحول افکار عمومی فرآیندی غیرارگادیک است که در برابر فرآیند ارگادیک قرار می‌گیرد؛ فرآیندی که در آن هر رویداد کوچکی با رویدادهای کوچک بعدی خنثی می‌شود. نگاه کنید به:
- W. Brian Arthur, "Competing Technologies, Increasing Returns, and Lock-In by Historical Events," *Economic Journal*, 99 (March 1989): 116-131.
7. F. M. Cornford, *Microcosmographia Academica, Being a Guide for the Young Academic Politician*, 2nd ed. (Cambridge: Bowes & Bowes, 1922), p. 4.
8. Jerry B. Harvey, "The Abilene Paradox: The Management of Agreement," *Organizational Dynamics*, 3 (Summer 1974): 63-80.
9. Elisabeth Noelle-Neumann, *The Spiral of Silence: Public Opinion-Our Social Skin*

(Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1984; first German ed., 1980).

10. Friedrich A. Hayek, *The Constitution of Liberty* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1960), pp. 395-411.

۱۱. برای مطالعه شرح مفصلی از معیار کارایی پارتو، نگاه کنید به:

T. C. Koopmans, *Three Essays on the State of Economic Science* (New York: McGraw Hill, 1956), pp. 41-66.

۱۲. برای مطالعه توضیح کامل‌تر نگاه کنید به:

Donald Wittman, "Why Democracies Produce Efficient Results," *Journal of Political Economy*, 97 (December 1395-1424 :{1989 .

13. George F. Hourani, "The Basis of Authority of Consensus in Sunnite Islam," *Studia Islamica*, 21 (1964): 13-60.

۱۴. در خصوص سابقه این ضرب‌المثل نگاه کنید به:

George Boas, *Vox Populi: Essays' in the History of an Idea* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Press, 1969), chap. 1.

15. Noelle-Neumann, *Spiral of Silence*, p. 175.

## ۷. سرسختی کمونیسم

۱. به‌منظور بررسی ادبیات دگراندیش، نگاه کنید به:

H. Gordon Skilling, "Samizdat" and an Independent Society in Central and Eastern Europe (Columbus: Ohio State University Press, 1989).

2. The words of Leon Trotsky, cited by Hannah Arendt, *The Origins of Totalitarianism*, 2nd ed. (New York: Meridian, 1958), p. 307.

3. Alexander Solzhenitsyn, "The Smatterers," in Solzhenitsyn et al., *From Under the Rubble*, trans. A. M. Brock et al. (Boston: Little, Brown, 1975; orig. Russian ed., 1974), p. 275.

4. Ibid., p. 276 (تاکید از منبع اصلی است)

5. Vaclav Havel, "The Power of the Powerless," in Havel et al., *The Power of the Powerless: Citizens against the State in Central-Eastern Europe*, ed. John Keane, trans. Paul Wilson (Armonk, N.Y.: M. E. Sharpe, 1985; orig. Czech ed., 1979), pp. 27-28.

6. Amanda Haight, *Anna Akhmatova: A Poetic Pilgrimage* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1976), chaps. 3-4; and *Encyclopaedia Britannica*, 15th ed., vol. 1 (1987), p. 190.

7. Aleksander Wat, *My Century: The Odyssey of a Polish Intellectual*, trans. Richard Lourie (New York: W. W. Norton, 1990; orig. Polish ed., 1977), p. 101.

۸. برای شناختی از کمپین علیه پاسترناک، نگاه کنید به:

Ronald Hingley, *Pasternak: A Biography* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1983), chap. 10.

9. H. Gordon Skilling, *Charter 77 and Human Rights in Czechoslovakia* (London: George Alien and Unwin, 1981).

همچنین نگاه کنید به:

Timothy Garton Ash, *The Uses of Adversity: Essays on the Fate of Central Europe* (New York: Random House, 1989; orig. publ., 1983-1989), especially pp. 61-70.

10. Krzysztof Nowak, "Covert Repressiveness and the Stability of a Political System: Poland at the End of the Seventies," *Social Research*, 55 (Spring/Summer 1988): 189 (emphasis omitted).

11. Leszek Kolakowski, *Main Currents of Marxism: Its Origin, Growth, and Dissolution*, vol. 3, trans. P. S. Falla (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1978), p. 91.

12. Jifi Ruml, "Who Really Is Isolated?" in Havel et al., *Power of the Powerless*, p. 180.

13. Jane Kramer, "Letter from Europe," *New Yorker*, May 25, 1992, p. 43. ..

14. Have!, "Power of the Powerless," p. 39 (emphasis in original).
15. Ibid.
16. Ibid., p. 37.
17. Timothy Garton Ash, "Eastern Europe: The Year of Truth," *New York Review of Books*, February 15, 1990, p. 18 (emphasis in original).
18. Authoritative accounts include Roy A. Medvedev, *Let History Judge: The Origins and Consequences of Stalinism*, trans. Colleen Taylor (New York: Vintage, 1973; orig. Russian ed., 1968); Robert Conquest, *The Great Terror: A Reassessment* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1990); and Zbigniew K. Brzezinski, *The Soviet Bloc: Unity and Conflict* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1960).
19. Nowak, "Covert Repressiveness," p. 193.
20. Czeslaw Milosz, *The Captive Mind*, trans. Jane Zielonko (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1953; orig. Polish ed., 1951), p. 54.
21. Quoted by Robert Conquest, *Tyrants and Typewriters: Communiques from the Struggle for Truth* (Lexington, Mass.: Lexington Books, 1989), p. 90.
22. Milosz, *Captive Mind*, especially pp. 43, 61.
23. See Nowak, "Covert Repressiveness"; and Helena Flam, "Fear, Loyalty, and Greedy Corporate Actors" {unpublished paper, University of Konstanz, 1992}.
24. Nowak, "Covert Repressiveness," p. 187.
25. Laszlo Bruszt, "'Without Us but for Us'? Political Orientation in Hungary in the Period of Late Paternalism," *Social Research*, 55 {Spring/Summer 1988}: table 3. The figures for the Western countries are from 1978.
26. Milosz, *Captive Mind*, p. 24.
27. Quoted in Jan Vladislav, "Encounters with History or *Une Education Sentimentale* 1938-68," in *The Prague Spring: A Mixed Legacy*, ed. Jifi Pehe {New York: Freedom House, 1988}, p. 12. Poem translated by A. G. Brain.
28. Vaclav Havel, *Disturbing the Peace: A Conversation with Karel Hvfzaa/a*, trans. Paul Wilson {New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1990; orig. Czech ed., 1986}, p. 138.
29. This point is developed at length by Vladimir Tismaneanu, *Reinventing Politics: Eastern Europe from Stalin to Havel* {New York: Free Press, 1992}, chaps. 4-5.

## ۸. ماندگاری نامیمون نظام کاستی

1. Mark Fineman, "Lynchings over Caste Stir India," *Los Angeles Times*, April 12, 1991, pp. A1, 18; and W. P. S. Sidhu, "Medieval Murders," *India Today*, April 30, 1991, pp. 122-125.
2. M. N. Srinivas, *Social Change in Modern India* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1971); Louis Dumont, *Homo Hierarchicus: The Caste System and Its Implications*, rev. ed., trans. Mark Sainsbury, Dumont, and Basia Gulati (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1980, orig. French ed., 1966); and Marc Galanter, *Competing Equalities: Law and the Backward Classes in India* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1984).
3. J. H. Hutton, *Caste in India: Its Nature, Function, and Origins*, 4th ed. (Bombay: Oxford University Press, 1963), pp. 64-67, 130, and Appendix A. Estimates go as high as 30 percent.
4. *Ibid.*, chap. 6; and Dumont, *Homo Hierarchicus*, chaps. 4-6.
5. Dumont, *Homo Hierarchicus*, especially pp. 46-49, 202-208; Hutton, *Caste in India*, chaps. 6-7 and Appendix A; Barrington Moore, Jr., *Injustice: The Social Bases of Obedience and Revolt* (White Plains, N.Y.: M. E. Sharpe, 1978), pp. 55-64; and L. S. S. O'Malley, *Indian Caste Customs* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1932), chap. 8.
6. O'Malley, *Indian Caste Customs*, p. 141.
7. Hutton, *Caste in India*, p. 121.
8. Imtiaz Ahmad, ed., *Caste and Social Stratification among Muslims in India* (New Delhi: Manohar, 1978), especially articles by M. K. A. Siddiqui and Ranjit K. Bhattacharya.
9. Deepak Lal, *The Hindu Equilibrium*, vol. 1: *Cultural Stagnation and Economic Stagnation, India c. 1500 B.C.-A.D. 1980* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1988), chap. 3.
10. The practice is noted by O'Malley, *Indian Caste Customs*, p. 142.
11. Max Weber, *The Religion of India: The Sociology of Hinduism and Buddhism*, trans. and ed. Hans H. Gerth and Don Martindale (New York: Free Press, 1958; orig. German ed., 1916-17), p. 112. Another such argument is provided by Angus Maddison, *Class Structure and Economic Growth: India and Pakistan since the Moghuls* (New York: W. W. Norton, 1971), especially pp. 24-29.
12. Jawaharlal Nehru, *The Discovery of India*, ed. Robert I. Crane (New York: Dou-



- bleday, 1959; orig. ed., 1946), especially sect. 4.7 and chap. 5; quote, p. 126.
13. M. N. Srinivas, "The Role of Caste in India: Present and Future," *Reviews in Anthropology*, 7 (Fall 1980): 415-430. Also see Dumont, *Homo Hierarchicus*, chap. 10.
14. Hutton, *Caste in India*, p. 123.
۱۵. بر اساس کتاب تعادل هندو، جلد اول، فصول ۲-۳، این نظام به زمان هجوم آریایی‌ها به هند، حدود سال ۱۵۰۰ پیش از میلاد بازمی‌گردد. تقسیم کار از پیش موجود در میان کشیش‌ها، جنگجویان و بازرگانان، مطالبات متناقضی در خصوص منزلت ایجاد کرد که موجب محدودیت‌های رفتاری متعددی شد. از آنجایی که آریایی‌ها زیستگاه‌های مبتنی بر کشاورزی را شکل دادند، با مشکل تأمین نیروی کار کافی مواجه شدند. در پاسخ، دشمنان بومی خود را به بردگی درآوردند و برای کار بر روی زمین از آنان استفاده کردند. شودراها زادگان این بردگان هستند. عاقبت، شودراها از اسارت رها شدند و به نظام کاستی نوظهور آریایی پیوستند. نجس بودن خیلی بدتر، هنگامی پدید آمد که آریایی‌ها با قبایل بومی متعددی تماس حاصل کردند. تمایل آریایی‌ها به کنترل کامل اراضی، منجر به مبارزات پایدار و اغلب خشونت‌آمیز برای دور نگه داشتن این ساکنان اولیه از جامعه آریایی شد. نظریه‌ای دیگر منشأ کاست را در تلاش برخی گروه‌های شغلی نسبتاً موفق برای محدود کردن گروه‌هایشان می‌دانند. نگاه کنید به:
- Mancur Olson, *The Rise and Decline of Nations: Economic Growth, Stagflation, and Social Rigidities* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1982), pp. 156-161.
16. Michael Moffatt, *An Untouchable Community in South India: Structure and Consensus* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1979), p. 7, n. 1.
17. Hutton, *Caste in India*, chap. 7.
18. V. S. Naipaul, *India: A Wounded Civilization* (New York: Vintage Books, 1977), p. 188.
۱۹. در خصوص اجرای آداب کاستی، نگاه کنید به:
- Thomas A. Zwicker; "Morality and Etiquette in the Reproduction of Hierarchical Caste Relations in South Asia," M.A. thesis, University of Pennsylvania, 1984.
۲۰. این مبحث در اینجا بسط داده شده است:
- George A. Akerlof, "The Economics of Caste and of the Rat Race and Other Woe-ful Tales," *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 90 (November 1976): 599-618. Akerlof's argument was anticipated by Weber, *Religion of India*, p. 19.
۲۱. در خصوص عملکرد دهکده‌ها نگاه کنید به:
- Dumont, *Homo Hier., archicus*, chap. 8; and Hutton, *Caste in India*, chap. 7.

22. Joseph A. Schumpeter, "Social Classes in an Ethnically Homogeneous Environment," in his *Imperialism and Social Classes*, trans. Heinz Norden (New York: Augustus Kelley, 1951; orig. ed., 1927), p.45.
23. Srinivas, *Social Change in Modern India*, pp. 100....,106.

## ۹. گسترش ناخواسته تبعیض مثبت

1. Michael Oreskes, "American Politics Loses Way as Polls Displace Leadership," *New York Times*, March 18, 1990, pp. A1, 22. The series continued to March 22.
۲. به عنوان مثال نگاه کنید به:  
Richard D. Lamm, "The Politics of Sensitivities: Critical Policy Issues Fester under Fear of Offending," *Los Angeles Times*; May 28, 1988, pt. 2, p. 8; Michael Ross, "U.S. Lawmakers Toss in Towel in Frustration," *Los Angeles Times*, April 13, 1992, pp. A1, 16-17; and Timothy E. Wirth, "It's Not Enough to Throw Bums Out," *Los Angeles Times*, June 17, 1992, p. B11.
3. "Serious Times, Trivial Politics," *New York Times*, March 25, 1990, sect. 4, p. 18.
4. Shelby Steele, *The Content of Our Character: A New Vision of Race in America* (New York: St. Martin's, 1990), p. x.
5. Richard G. Niemi, John Mueller, and Tom W. Smith, *Trends in Public Opinion: A Compendium of Survey Data* (New York: Greenwood Press, 1989), chap. 8. The figures come from table 8.3. See also Howard Schuman, Charlotte Steeh, and Laurence Bobo, *Racial Attitudes in America: Trends and Interpretations* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1985), chap. 3.
6. Arlene F. Saluter, *Marital Status and Living Arrangements: March 1991* (Washington, D.C.: U.S. Government Printing Office, 1992), table E.
7. Jack Citrin, Donald Philip Green, and David O. Sears, "White Reactions to Black Candidates: When Does Race Matter?" *Public Opinion Quarterly*, 54 (Spring 1990): 74-96.
8. Lee Sigelman and Susan Welch, *Black Americans' Views of Racial Inequality: The Dream Deferred* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991), p. 131.
9. *Ibid.*, p. 129.
10. *Response Community*, 2 (Spring 1992), p. 82.
11. Andrew Hacker, *Two Nations: Black and White, Separate, Hostile, Unequal* (New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1992), pp. 4, passim. See also Jonathan Rieder, *Carnegie: The Jews and Italians of Brooklyn Against Liberalism* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1985), especially chaps. 3-5.

۱۲. بر اساس تحقیقی که در سال ۱۹۸۶ توسط موسسه پژوهش اجتماعی میشیگان انجام شد، از هر چهار سفیدپوست، سه نفر اینکه در رقابت بر سر یک موقعیت شغلی با یک سیاه‌پوست دارای قابلیت‌های مساوی یا کمتر از ایشان، نادیده گرفته شوند را «محتمل» یا «بسیار محتمل» دانسته

بودند. اطلاعات مربوطه در منبع زیر آمده است:

Dinesh D'Souza, *Illiberal Education: The Politics of Race and Sex on Campus* (New York: Free Press, 1991), p. 131.

۱۳. نارضایتی و خشم کارگران اینجا مستند شده و مورد تحلیل قرار گرفته است:

Frederick R. Lynch, *Invisible Victims: White Males and the Crisis of Affirmative Action* (New York: Greenwood Press, 1989).

فراگیری این خشم در جلسات گروه کانونی برگزار شده در سال ۱۹۸۵ توسط یک شرکت نظرسنجی دموکرات ظاهر شد. بر مبنای گزارشاتی که در پی این تحقیق منتشر شدند «منزلت ویژه سیاهان توسط تقریباً همه [اعضای گروه] به مثابه مانعی جدی بر سر راه پیشرفت شخصی‌شان ادراک شد. البته که تبعیض علیه سفیدپوستان به تبیینی حاضر و آماده و درونی‌شده برای منزلت، آسیب‌پذیری، و شکست‌های ایشان بدل شده بود.» به نقل از:

Thomas Byrne Edsall and Mary D. Edsall, *Chain Reaction: The Impact of Race, Rights, and Taxes on American Politics* (New York: W. W. Norton, 1991), p. 182.

14. Paul M. Sniderman and Thomas Piazza, *The Scar of Race* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1993).

15. Ibid., pp. 69-78.

16. Ibid., pp. 102-104.

17. Benjamin I. Page and Robert Y. Shapiro, *The Rational Public: Fifty Years of Trends in Americans' Policy Preferences* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1992), especially chap. 3.

18. Edsall and Edsall, *Chain Reaction*, especially chaps. 9-11.

19. *Economist*, November 30, 1991, pp. 47-48.

20. Terry Eastland, "In This White House, Principle Is Just the Politics of the Day," *Los Angeles Times*, December 19, 1990, p. B11.

21. Patrick Thomas, "The Persistent 'Gnat' that Louisiana Can't Get Out of Its Face," *Los Angeles Times*, October 14, 1990, p. M1.

22. Andrew Rosenthal, "Broad Disparities in Votes and Polls Raising Questions," *New York Times*, November 9, 1989, pp. A1, B14; and J. Phillip Thompson, "David Dinkins' Victory in New York City: The

Decline of the Democratic Party. Organization and the Strengthening of Black Politics," *PS: Political Science and Politics*, 23 (June 1990): 145-148.

۲۴. گزینش‌شده از سخنرانی بازنشر شده در:

David J. Garrow, *Bearing the Cross: Martin Luther King, Jr., and the Southern Christian Leadership Conference* (New York: William Morrow, 1986), pp. 283-284.

24. James P. Smith and Finis R. Welch, "Black Economic Progress since Myrdal," *Journal of Economic Literature*, 27 (June 1989): 519- 564.

25. Deborah J. Carter and Reginald Wilson, *Minorities in Higher Education* (Washington, D.C.: American Council on Education, December 1989), p. 20.

26. Smith and Welch, "Black Economic Progress," pp:552-557. See also Jonathan S. Leonard, "The Impact of Affirmative Action Regulation and Equal Employment Law on Black Employment," *Journal of Economic*

*Perspectives*, 4 (Fall1990): 47-63.

27. Richard B. Freeman, *Black Elite: The New Market for Highly Educated Black Americans* (New York: McGraw Hill, 1976), p. 34.

28. Thomas Sowell, *Education: Assumptions versus History* (Stanford: Hoover Institution Press, 1986), pp. 81-89.

29. Thomas Sowell, *Civil Rights: Rhetoric- or Reality?* (New York: William Morrow, 1984), pp. 49-50.

30. Edsall and Edsall, *Chain Reaction*, table 11.3.

۳۱. آمارها از منبع زیر استخراج شده‌اند:

Robin Williams, Jr., and Gerald David Jaynes, eds., *A Common Destiny: Blacks and American Society* (Washington, D.C.: National Academy Press, 1989).

32. Stephen L. Carter, *Reflections of an Affirmative Action Baby* (New York: Basic Books, 1991); Richard A. Epstein, *Forbidden Grounds: The Case against Employment Discrimination Laws* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1992); Nathan Glazer, *Affirmative Discrimination: Ethnic Inequality and Public Policy* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1987; orig. pub., 1975); Glenn C. Loury, "Why Should We Care about Group Inequality," *Social Philosophy and Policy*, 5 (Autumn 1987): 249-271; Stephen Coate and Loury, "Will Affirmative-Action Policies Eliminate Negative Stereotypes," *American Economic Review*, 83 (December 1993): 1220-1240; Sowell, *Civil Rights*; Steele, *Content of Our Character*; and William Julius Wilson, *The Truly Disadvantaged: The Inner City, the Underclass, and Public Policy* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1987).

33. Gertrude Ezorsky, *Racism and Justice: The Case for Affirmative Action* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1991).
  34. U. S. Department of Labor, Office of Policy Planning and Research, *The Negro Family: The Case for National Action* (Washington, D.C.: Government Printing Office, 1965).
  35. Ibid., pp. 47-48.
  36. E. Franklin Frazier, *The Negro Family in the United States* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1939).
  37. Herbert G. Gutman, *The Black Family in Slavery and Freedom, 1750-1925* (New York: Pantheon, 1976).
۳۸. نقل قول‌ها از منبع زیر استخراج شده‌اند:
- Lee Rainwater and William L. Yancey, *The Moynihan Report and the Politics of Controversy* (Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press, 1967), pp. 172-173, 259.
۳۹. همان‌گونه که در اینجا ذکر شد، مقاله لوری مشتمل بر جزئیات بسیار بیشتر و تفسیر غنی است:  
Glenn C. Loury, "The Family, the Nation, and Senator Moynihan," *Commentary*, June 1986, p. 22.
40. Rainwater and Yancey, *Moynihan Report*, pp. 247-248, 256.
  41. William Ryan, "Savage Discovery: The Moynihan Report," *Nation*, November 22, 1965, pp. 380-384. Quotes drawn from an abridged reprint in Rainwater and Yancey, *Moynihan Report*, pp. 458, 464\_
  42. Ibid., pp. 259-260.
  43. Daniel Patrick Moynihan, *Family and Nation: The Godkin Lectures, Harvard University* (San Diego: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1986), p. 36.
  44. Hacker, *Two Nations*, p. 68.
  45. Glenn C. Loury, "The Family as Context for Delinquency Prevention: Demographic Trends and Political Realities," in *From Children to Citizens*, vol. 3, ed. James Q. Wilson and Glenn C. Loury (New York: Springer-Verlag, 1985), 3-26.
  46. Jiril Sleeper, *The Closest of Strangers: Liberalism and the Politics of Race in New York* (New York: W. W. Norton, 1990), pp. 253-254.
  47. Ellen Goodman, "And He Serves to Free Long-Buried Feelings," *Los Angeles Times*, January 18, 1985, pt. 2, p. 5.

48. Hacker, *Two Nations*, p. 192.
49. Goodman, "And He Serves to Free Long-Buried Feelings."
50. Ellen Goodman, "Polite Silence All Around While the Monsters Prowl," *International Herald Tribune*, December 13, 1991, p. 7.
51. Morton Hunt, *Profiles of Social Research: The Scientific Study of Human Interactions* (New York: Sage, 1985), p. 84-92. For Coleman's own account of the episode, see his remarks in *Footnotes*, 17 (January 1989): 4-5.
52. Thomas B. Rosenstiel, "Paper's Editorial Sparks Racial Uproar in Philadelphia," *Los Angeles Times*, December 20, 1990, p. A32.

۵۳. نگاه کنید به:

Carter, *Reflections*, chaps. 5-8; and Glenn C. Loury, "The Problem of Ideology and Political Discourse among Afro-Americans" (unpublished manuscript chapter, Harvard University, 1986).

۵۴. همان‌گونه که توسط کارتر نقل قول شده است: Carter, *Reflections*, p. 108.

55. Alphonso Pinkney, *The Myth of Black Progress* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1984), pp. 14-15.

56. Carter, *Reflections*, pp. 111-112.

57. Sleeper, *Closest of Strangers*, especially pp. 80-85.

58. Linda S. Lichter, "Who Speaks for Black America?" *Public Opinion* (August/September 1985), pp. 41-44.

۵۹. همه این نکات با در نظر گرفتن کاندیداتوری جسی جکسون برای ریاست جمهوری در اینجا شرح داده شده است:

by Adolph L. Reed, Jr., *The Jesse Jackson Phenomenon: The Crisis of Purpose in Afro-American Politics* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1986).

## ۱۰. گفتمان عمومی و دانش شخصی

۱. برای مروری بر اثر لایبنیتز، نگاه کنید به:

For an overview of Leibniz's work, see Bertrand Russell, *A History of Western Philosophy* (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1945), pp. 581-596.

۲. تأثیرگذارترین دفاع مدرن از فرض ترجیح ثابت را اینجا می‌توانید مطالعه کنید:

George J. Stigler and Gary Becker, "De Gustibus Non Est Disputandum," *American Economic Review*, 67 (March 1977): 76-90.

۳. منبع الهام برای این تمایز را در اینجا می‌توانید ببینید:

Viktor Vanberg and James M. Buchanan, "Interests and Theories in Constitutional Choice," *Journal of Theoretical Politics*, 1 (January 1989): 49-62.

دانشوران مختلف دیگری شکل‌پذیری دانش بشری و ترجیحات انسان را مورد شناسایی قرار داده‌اند. برای نمونه نگاه کنید به:

Norbert Elias, *Power and Civility*, trans. Edmund Jephcott (New York: Pantheon, 1982; orig. German ed., 1939); Edward Shils, *Tradition* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1981); S. Ryan Johansson, "The Computer Paradigm and the Role of Cultural Information in Social Systems," *Historical Methods*, 21 (Fall 1988): 172-188; Randall Bartlett, *Economics and Power: An Inquiry into Human Relations and Markets* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989), chap. 9; and James S. Coleman, *Foundations of Social Theory* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1990), especially chaps. 10-12.

4. Herbert A. Simon, *Reason in Human Affairs* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1983).

۵. مقالات اصلی درباره میان‌برهای ذهنی اینجا یافت می‌شوند:

Daniel Kahneman, Paul Slovic, and Amos Tversky, eds., *Judgment under Uncertainty: Heuristics and Biases* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1982; chaps. orig. pub. 1971-1982). An overview is provided by Richard Nisbett and Lee Ross, *Human Inference: Strategies and Shortcomings of Social Judgment* (Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, 1980).

آنتونی پرتکانیس و البوت آرونسون ملاحظه کردند که محتمل‌ترین حالت استفاده از میان‌برهای ذهنی تحت یک یا چند شرط از شرایط زیر است: ما زمان کافی برای تفکر دقیق درباره موضوعی را نداریم؛ مقدار اطلاعاتی که به ما داده شده، بیش از میزانی است که توان پردازش کامل آن را داریم؛ موضوعات دارای اهمیت چندانی نیستند؛ اطلاعات جانبی ما به‌حدی ناچیز است که نمی‌توانیم تصمیم‌مان را بر آن مبتنی کنیم؛ و بدین ترتیب میان‌برهای مذکور فوراً به ذهن‌مان می‌رسند. نگاه کنید به:



*Age of Propaganda: The Everyday Use and Abuse of Persuasion* (New York: W. H. Freeman, 1991), p. 121.

ع دو مطالعه برجسته در این زمینه عبارتند از:

John H. Holland, Keith J. Holyoak, Richard E. Nisbett, and Paul R. Thagard, *Induction: Processes of Inference, Learning, and Discovery* (Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press, 1986); and Howard Margolis, *Patterns, Thinking, and Cognition: A Theory of Judgment* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1987). For studies concerned specifically with models pertaining to political issues, see Richard R. Lau and David O. Sears, eds., *Political Cognition: The 19th Annual Carnegie Symposium 011 Cognition* (Hillsdale, N.J.: Lawrence Erlbaum, 1986).

7. Nisbett and Ross, *Human Inference*, p. 245. See also George Mandler, *Mind and Emotion* (New York: John Wiley, 1975).

8. John Zaller and Stanley Feldman, "A Simple Theory of the Survey Response: Answering Questions versus Revealing Preferences," *American journal of Political Science*, 36 (August 1992): 579-616.

9. Daniel Kahneman and Amos Tversky, "Choices, Values, and Frames," *American Psychologist*, 39 (April 1984): 341-350.

10. Alexis de Tocqueville, *Democracy in America*, vol. 2, ed. Henry Reeve, Francis Bowen, and Phillips Bradley (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1989; orig. French ed., 1835), p. 8.

11. Albert Bandura, *Social Learning Theory* (Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, 1977).

۱۲. این نکته به‌طور مفصل اینجا پرورده شده است:

Gordon Tullock, *Toward a Mathematics of Politics* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1967), chaps. 7-8; and Hannah Arendt, "Lying in Politics," in her *Crises of the Republic* (New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1972), pp. 1-47.

13. Niccolo Machiavelli, *The Prince*, trans. and ed. Thomas G. Bergin (Northbrook, Ill.: AHM Publishing, 1947; orig. Italian ed., 1532), chap. 18.

۱۴. من اینجا به سمت راسل کشیده شدم: *History of Western Philosophy*, p. 510.

۱۵. هرچه چیزها بیشتر تغییر می‌کنند، بیشتر یکنواخت می‌مانند.

۱۶. این نظریه که الگوهای ماندگار تفکر، انتشار نظرات را قاعده‌مند می‌کنند اینجا توسط هیرشمن پرورده شد:

Albert O. Hirschman, *The Rhetoric of Reaction: Perversity, Futility, Jeopardy* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1991).

17. Plato, *The Republic*, trans. Francis M. Cornford (New York: Oxford University Press, 1945; first Greek ed., 4th c. B.C.E.), Chap 10. See also Sissela Bok, *Lying: Moral Choice in Public and Private Life* (New York: Pantheon, 1978), chap. 12; and Kaushik Basu, "Bad Advice," *Economic and Political Weekly*, March 7-14, 1992, pp. 525-530.

۱۸. برای نظر اجمالی به سانسور در دوره معاصر نگاه کنید به:

Kevin Boyle, ed., *Article Nineteen: Information, Freedom, and Censorship* (New York: Times Books, 1988).

۱۹. این گزاره توسط لیپمن پرورده شد:

Waiter Lippmann, *Public Opinion* (New York: Harcourt, Brace and Company, 1922). Later variants include Joseph A. Schumpeter, *Capitalism, Socialism, and Democracy*, 3rd ed. (New York: Harper & Row, 1942), chaps. 20-23; and Anthony Downs, *An Economic Theory of Democracy* (New York: Harper & Row, 1957), chaps. 11-13

برای بررسی پژوهشی مرتبط نگاه کنید به:

Donald R. Kinder and David O. Sears, "Public Opinion and Political Action," in *The Handbook of Social Psychology*, 3rd ed., vol. 2, ed. Gardner Lindzey and Elliot Aronson (New York: Random House, 1985), pp. 659-741.

20. W. Russell Neuman, *The Paradox of Mass Politics: Knowledge and Opinion in the American Electorate* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1986), p. 15.

21. *Ibid.*, pp. 14-22.

22. "The American Public's Knowledge of the U.S. Constitution: A National Survey of Public Awareness and Personal Opinion" (San Francisco: Hearst Corporation, n.d.), p. 13.

۲۳. این بحث توسط نیومن پرورده شد: Neuman, *Paradox of Mass Politics*.

۲۴. اصل هنجاری مبنای این ایده توسط کلی پرورده شده است:

Harold H. Kelley, "Attribution Theory in Social Psychology," in *Nebraska Symposium on Motivation*, ed. David Levine (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1967), pp. 192-238.

۲۵. واژگان از کلمن است: *Foundations*

۲۶. اصطلاح «اثبات اجتماعی» از اینجا می‌آید:

Robert B. Cialdini, *Influence: The New Psychology of Modern Persuasion* (New York:

Quill, 1984), chap. 4.

27. James Madison, "The Federalist no. 49" (1788), in *The Federalist*, ed. Jacob E. Cooke (Middletown, Conn.: Wesleyan University Press, 1961), p. 340.

28. Bernard Lewis, *History Remembered, Recovered, Invented* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1975); and David Lowenthal, *The Past Is a Foreign Country* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985).

29. Joseph Schacht, *The Origins of Muhammadan Jurisprudence*, 3<sup>rd</sup> ed. (London: Oxford University Press, 1959).

مجهول‌العنوان‌ها در سایر ادیان نیز معمول هستند. برای دیدن ارجاعات به پاورقی قبلی مراجعه کنید:  
۳۰. همان‌گونه که در اینجا نقل قول شده است:

Elisabeth Noelle-Neumann, *The Spiral of Silence: Public Opinion-Our Social Skin* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1984; orig. German ed., 1980), p. 66.

۳۱. برای مشاهده استفاده عالمانه از شیوه‌های اثبات اجماعی نگاه کنید به:

Thomas S. Kuhn, *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1970); and Thomas Sowell, *Knowledge and Decisions* (New York: Basic Books, 1980).

32. Pratkanis and Aronson, *Age of Propaganda*, pp. 134-139.

33. David Hackett Fischer, *Historians' Fallacies: Toward a Logic of Historical Thought* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1971), p. 302.

34. Amos Tversky and Daniel Kahneman, "Availability: A Heuristic for Judging Frequency and Probability," in *Judgment under Uncertainty*, ed. Kahneman, Slovic, and Tversky, pp. 163-178. See also

Shelley E. Taylor, "The Availability Bias in Social Perception and Interaction," in *Judgment under Uncertainty*, ed. Kahneman, Slovic, and Tversky, pp. 190-200.

35. Everett M. Rogers and James W. Dearing, "Agenda-Setting Research: Where Has It Been, Where Is It Going?" in *Communication Yearbook 11*, ed. James A. Anderson (Beverly Hills, Calif.: Sage Publications, 1988), pp. 555-594.

36. Lynn Hasher, David Goldstein, and Thomas Toppino, "Frequency and the Confluence of Referential Validity," *Journal of Verbal Learning and Verbal Behavior*, 16 (February 1977): 107-112.

37. Marian Schwartz, "Repetition and Rated Truth Value of Statements," *American Journal of Psychology*, 95 (Fall 1982): 393-407.

38. This illustration bears the influence of Erich Fromm, *Escape from Freedom* (New York: Avon Books, 1969; orig. ed., 1941), pp. 208-230.
39. Joseph Harriss, *The Tallest Tower: Eiffel and the Belle Epoque* (Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1975), pp. 19-23.
40. George Bishop, "Manipulation and Control of People's Responses to Public Opinion Polls: An Orwellian Experiment in 1984," in *The Orwellian Moment: Hindsight and Foresight in the Post-1984 World*, ed.
- Robert L. Savage, James Combs, and Dan Nimmo (Fayetteville: University of Arkansas Press, 1989), pp. 119-129.
41. J. St. B. T. Evans and P. C. Wason, "Rationalization in a Reasoning Task," *British Journal of Psychology*, 67 (November 1976): 479-486.

همچنین نگاه کنید به:

- P. N. Johnson-Laird and P. C. Wason, "A Theoretical Analysis of Insight into a Reasoning Task," in their *Thinking: Readings in Cognitive Science* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1977), pp. 143-157; and Margolis, *Patterns, Thinking, and Cognition*, especially chap. 1.
42. This point is developed by Noelle-Neumann, *Spiral of Silence*, chap. 23.
43. Daniel Lerner, *The Passing of Traditional Society: Modernizing the Middle East* (New York: Free Press, 1958).
44. Ronald Heiner, "The Origin of Predictable Behavior," *American Economic Review*, 73 (September 1983): 560-595.
45. Neuman, *Paradox of Mass Politics*, pp. 61-64.
46. Nisbett and Ross, *Human Inference*, chap. 8.
47. K. R. L. Hall, "Perceiving and Naming a Series of Figures," *Quarterly Journal of Experimental Psychology*, 2 (November 1950): 153-162;
48. Charles G. Lord, Lee Ross, and Mark R. Lepper, "Biased Assimilation and Attitude Polarization: The Effects of Prior Theories on Subsequently Considered Evidence," *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 37 (November 1979): 2098-2109.

۴۹. شواهد بسیاری درباره ادراک الگوهای جعلی از سوی گیلوویچ ارائه شده‌اند:

- Thomas Gilovich, *How We Know What Isn't So: The Fallibility of Human Reason in Everyday Life* (New York: Free Press, 1991).

50. David O. Sears, Richard R. Lau, Tom R. Tyler, and Harris M. Allen, Jr., "Self-Interest vs. Symbolic Politics in Policy Attitudes and Presidential Voting," *American Political Science Review*, 74 (September 1980): 670-684; and Lau, Thad A. Brown, and Sears, "Self-Interest and Civilians' Attitudes toward the Vietnam War," *Public Opinion Quarterly*, 42 (Winter 1978): 464-483.
51. Neuman, *Paradox of Mass Politics*, p. 69.
52. . Joseph P. Kalt and Mark A. Zupan, "Capture and Ideology in the Economic Theory of Politics," *American Economic Review*, 74 (June 1984): 279-300.
53. James C. Scott, *Domination and the Arts of Resistance: Hidden Transcripts* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1990). The quote is from p. 110 (emphasis in original).
54. Sharon S. Brehm and Jack W. Brehm, *Psychological Reactance: A Theory of Freedom and Control* (New York: Academic Press, 1981).

### ۱۱. نیندیشیدنی و ناندیشیدنی

1. Mohammed Arkoun, "Emergences et Problemes dans le Monde Musulman Contemporain (1960-1985)," *Islamochristiana*, 12 (1986):158-159 .
2. For recent examples, see Fazlur Rahman, *Islam and Modernity: Transformation of an Intellectual Tradition* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1982); and William Montgomery Watt, *Islamic Fundamentalism and Modernity* (London: Routledge, 1988).
3. Edward E. Jones and Richard E. Nisbett, "The Actor and the Observer: Divergent Perceptions of the Causes of Behavior," in *Attribution: Perceiving the Causes of Behavior*, ed. Jones et al. (Morristown, N.J.: General Learning Press, 1972), pp. 79-94. For a survey of related research, see Edward E. Jones, "How Do People Perceive the Causes of Behavior?" *American Scientist*, 64 (May-June 1976): 300-305.
4. Richard Nisbett and Lee Ross, *Human Inference: Strategies and Shortcomings of Social Judgment* (Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, 1980), chap. 9.
5. For some complementary insights, see Daniel B. Klein, "If Government Is So Villainous, How Come Government Officials Don't Seem Like Villains," *Economics and Philosophy*, 10 (April 1994): 91-106.
6. Leon Festinger, *A Theory of Cognitive Dissonance* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1957). For extensions of Festinger's theory, see George A. Akerlof and William T. Dickens, "The Economic Consequences of Cognitive Dissonance," *American Economic Review*, 72 (June 1982): 307-319; Ekkehart Schlicht, "Cognitive Dissonance in Economics," *Gesellschaft fur Wirtschafts- und Sozialwissenschaften*, 141:61-81 (1984); and Matthew Rabin, "Cognitive Dissonance and Social Change," *Journal of Economic Behavior and Organization*, 23 (March 1994): 177-194.
7. Festinger, *Theory of Cognitive Dissonance*, chaps. 4-5.
8. *Ibid.*, chaps. 6-7.
9. Michael Polanyi, *The Tacit Dimension* (Gloucester, Mass.: Peter Smith, 1983; orig. ed., 1966), p. 61.
10. Bernard Cohen, *The Press and Foreign Policy* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1963); Maxwell E. McCombs and Donald L. Shaw, "The Agenda-Setting Function of the Media," *Public Opinion Quarterly*,

- 36 (Summer 1972): 176-187; and G. Ray Funkhouser, "The Issues of the Sixties: An Exploratory Study in the Dynamics of Public Opinion," *Public Opinion Quarterly*, 37 (Spring 1973): 62-75.
11. John H. Holland, Keith J. Holyoak, Richard E. Nisbett, and Paul Thagard, *Induction: Processes of Inference, Learning, and Discovery*. Cambridge; Mass.: MIT Press, 1986.
12. Thomas Kuhn, *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions*, 2nd ed. (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1970).
13. Howard Margolis, *Patterns, Thinking, and Cognition: A Theory of Judgment* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1987), chaps. 11-13.
۱۴. به‌جز، احتمالاً، آستانه‌ای در یک سر طیف
۱۵. با یا بدون از دست رفتن حافظه، افکار عمومی بر روی ۱۰۰ باقی می‌ماند. تمایز میان دو عدد ۰ است، که معادل ۰ درصد دامنه افکار عمومی است.
16. Waiter Bagehot, *Physics and Politics* (Boston: Beacon Press, 1956; orig. ed. 1884), p. 26.
17. W. Brian Arthur, "Self-Reinforcing Mechanisms in Economics," in *The Economy as an Evolving Complex System*, ed. Philip W. Anderson, Kenneth J. Arrow, and David Pines (Redwood City, Calif.: Addison-Wesley, 1988), pp. 9-31.
18. Sushil Bikchandani, David Hirshleifer, and Ivo Welsh, "A Theory of Fads, Fashion, Custom, and Cultural Change as Informational Cascades," *Journal of Political Economy*, 100 (October 1992): 992-1026.
19. George A. Akerlof, "A Theory of Social Custom, of Which Unemployment May Be One Consequence," *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 94 (June 1980): 749-775.

## ۱۲. اخلاق کاستی تسلیم‌طلبی

1. K. S. Mathur, "Hindu Values of Life: Karma and Dharma" (1964), in *Religion in India*, ed. T. N. Madan (Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1991), pp. 63-77.
2. R. S. Khare, *The Untouchable as Himself: Ideology, Identity, and Pragmatism among the Lucknow Chamars* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1984).
3. Joan P. Mencher, "The Caste System Upside Down, or the NotSo- Mysterious East," *Current Anthropology*, 15 (December 1974): 469-493 .
4. Mark Juergensmeyer, "What if the Untouchables Don't Believe in Untouchability?" *Bulletin of Concerned Asian Scholars*, 12 (January/March 24): (1980 .
5. M. N. Srinivas, *The Remembered Village* (Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1976), p. 182.
6. Khare, *Untouchable as Himself*, pp. 7-8, passim.
7. Juergensmeyer, "What if the Untouchables," p. 25.
8. Michael Moffatt, *An Untouchable Community in South India: Structure and Consensus* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1979); and Hazari, *Untouchable: The Autobiography of an Indian Outcaste* (London: Pall Mall Press, 1969), especially chaps. 1, 5; and James M. Freeman, *Untouchable: An Indian Life History* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1979), passim. For an enlightening discussion and additional references, see Barrington Moore, Jr., *Injustice: The Social Bases of Obedience and Revolt* (White Plains, N.Y.: M. E. Sharpe, 1978), pp. 55-64.
9. Quoted by L. S. S. O'Malley, *Indian Caste Customs* (London: Cambridge University Press, 1932), p. 138.
10. Hazari, *Untouchable*, p. 11.
11. Max Weber, *The Religion of India: The Sociology of Hinduism and Buddhism*, trans. and ed. Hans H. Gerth and Don Martindale (New York: Free Press, 1958; orig. German ed., 1916-17), especially pp. 117-123 .
12. Hazari, *Untouchable*, p. 65.
13. G. S. Ghurye, *Caste, Class, and Occupation*, 4th ed. (Bombay: Popular Book Depot, 1961), chap. 9, especially pp. 218-221.14 . J. H. Hutton, *Caste in India: Its Nature, Function, and Origins*, 4th ed. (Bombay: Oxford University Press, 1963), p. 47.



۱۵. برای گزارشی از تحقیقات اولیه اروپائیان درباره موضوع کاست نگاه کنید به:

Bernard S. Cohn, "Notes on the History of the Study of Indian Society and Culture," in *Structure and Change in Indian Society*, ed. Milton Singer and Bernard S. Cohn (New York: Wenner-Gren Foundation for Anthropological Research, 1968), pp. 3-28.

استدلال شده که جامعه دانشگاهی اروپایی ایدئولوژی هندو را متعارف کرده و اهمیت مفاهیمی همچون کاست و تناسخ را افزایش داده است. بنا بر گزارش زیر بریتانیایی‌ها به ساخته شدن جهان‌بینی کاست‌محور یاری رسانده و همچنین تثبیت و مستحکم کردن تمایزات کاستی به لحاظ تاریخی سیال را ترغیب کردند.

elaborated by Ashis Nandy, *The Intimate Enemy: Loss and Recovery of Self under Colonialism* (Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1983)

مدعیات فوق غیرمحمتمل هستند. نخست اینکه تنها معدودی از هندیانی که محققان اروپایی تحت عنوان دارندگان عقاید هندو شناسایی کردند، از قبل با انگلیسی‌ها تماس داشتند. دوم اینکه بخش نامتناسبی از آنان که تماس‌هایی [با انگلیسی‌ها] داشتند، همانند نخبگان تحصیلکرده انگلستان، [اتفاقاً] مبدل به فعالین ضدکاستی شدند. سوم، اگر بریتانیایی‌ها به راحتی می‌توانستند هندیان را شستشوی مغزی دهند، بسیار غیرمحمتمل است که تا آن زمان اذهان آنان در برابر فشارهای وارده از سوی فرهنگ خودشان مصون مانده باشند. سرانجام، حاکمان نمی‌توانند الگوهای فکری یک ملت را مطابق اراده‌شان شکل دهند. اصلاح‌طلبان ضدکاستی که در پی رهایی‌بخش‌ها از چنگ «ایدئولوژی برهمن» بوده‌اند، این نکته را به تجربه می‌دانند. همان‌گونه که اینجا بدان اشاره شده است، کارزارهای آنان علیه اخلاق کاستی با مقاومت همان‌هایی مواجه شد که خواهان کمک به آنها بودند:

Khare, *Untouchable as Himself*, especially chap. 7, their campaigns

16. Vivekanand Jha, "Stages in the History of Untouchables," *Indian Historical Review*, 2 (July 1975): 14-31.

17. Gary S. Becker, *The Economics of Discrimination*, 2nd ed. (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1971).

18. Lquis Dumont, *Homo Hierarchicus: The Caste System and Its Implications*, rev. ed., trans. Mark Sainsbury, Dumont, and Basia Gulati (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1980, orig. French ed., 1966), especially pp. 8-11.

۱۹. یک استثنای قابل ملاحظه در موضوع کاست مورد زیر است:

Thomas A. Zwicker, "Morality and Etiquette in the Reproduction of Hierarchical Caste Relations in South Asia," M.A. thesis, University of Pennsylvania, 1984.

20. For two variants of the Marxian thesis, see Narmadeshwar Prasad, *The Myth of the Caste System* (Patna: Samjna Prakashan, 1957); and Gerald D. Berreman, "The Brahmanical View of Caste: Louis Dumont's *Homo Hierarchicus*," *Contributions to Indian Sociology*, new ser. 5 (December 16-23): (1971).

۲۱. عبارت مرتبط مارکس توسط الستر ارائه و تفسیر شده است:

Jon Elster, *Making Sense of Marx* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985), chap. 8. Elster develops this theory of ideology in his *Sour Grapes: Studies in the Subversion of Rationality* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983), chaps. 3-4, drawing on Paul Veyne, *Le Pain et le Cirque* (Paris: Seuil, 1976).

۲۲. برای ملاحظه تاریخچه مختصری از جنبش ضدکاستی نگاه کنید به:

Eleanor Zelliott, "Untouchability," in *Encyclopedia of Asian History*, vol. 4 (New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1988), 169-171. Detailed accounts are offered

by M. N. Srinivas, *Social Change in Modern India* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1971); and Marc Galanter, *Competing Equalities: Law and the Backward Classes in India* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1984).

### ۱۳. نقاط کور کمونیسم

1. Hannah Arendt, *The Origins of Totalitarianism*, 2nd ed. (New York: World Publishing, 1958), chaps. 11-13; and George Orwell, 1984 (New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1961; orig. ed., 1949).
2. Alexander Solzhenitsyn, "As Breathing and Consciousness Return," in Solzhenitsyn et al., *From Under the Rubble*, trans. A. M. Brock et al. (Boston: Little, Brown, 1975; orig. Russian ed., 1974), p. 4.
3. Ibid., p. 15 (emphasis in original).
4. Alexander Solzhenitsyn, *Rebuilding Russia: Reflections and Tentative Proposals*, trans. Alexis Klimoff (New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 1991; orig. Russian ed., 1990), p. 34.
5. V. I. Lenin, *State and Revolution* (New York: International Publishers, 1932; orig. Russian ed., 1917), especially sect. 1.4 and chap. 5.
6. Karl Marx, *A Contribution to the Critique of Political Economy*, vol. 29 of his and Frederick Engels's *Collected Works* (New York: International Publishers, 1987; orig. German ed., 1859), p. 263.
7. Geoffrey A. Hosking, "Memory in a Totalitarian Society: The Case of the Soviet Union," in *Memory: History, Culture, and the Mind*, ed. Thomas Butler (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1989), p. 115. The rest of the essay contains concrete examples of the rewriting of history.
8. Milan Kundera, *A Book on Laughter and Forgetting*, trans. Michael Henry Heim (New York: Penguin Books, 1981), p. 3. As quoted by Jeffrey C. Goldfarb, *Beyond Glasnost: The Post-Totalitarian Mind* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1989), pp. 109-110.
9. Elemer Hankiss, "The 'Second Society': Is There an Alternative Social Model Emerging in Contemporary Hungary?" *Social Research*, SS (Spring/Summer 1988), p. 28.
10. Daniil Granin, as quoted by David Wedgwood Benn, *Persuasion and Soviet Politics* (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1989), p. 195.
11. Miroslav Kusy, "Chartism and 'Real Socialism,'" in Vaclav Havel et al., *The Power of the Powerless: Citizens against the State in Central Eastern Europe*, ed. John Keane, trans. Paul Wilson (Armonk, N.Y.: M. E. Sharpe, 1985; orig. Czech ed., 1979), pp. 158-159.

12. Robert C. Tucker, *Political Culture and Leadership in Soviet Russia* (New York: W. W. Norton, 1987), pp. 142-143.

13. Piotr Wierzbicki, "A Treatise on Ticks" (orig. Polish ed., 1979), in *Poland: Genesis of a Revolution*, ed. Abraham Brumberg (New York: Random House, 1983), pp. 206-207.

۱۴. برای ملاحظه شواهدی از اتحاد شوروی نگاه کنید به:

James W. Riordan, "The Revolution from Below: The Role of Letters to the Editor under *Perestroika*," *Coexistence*, 27 (December 1990): 269-272.

15. This point is developed by Giuseppe di Palma, "Legitimation from the Top to Civil Society: Politico-Cultural Change in Eastern Europe," *World Politics*, 44 (October 1991), especially pp. 55-63.

16. Zhores A. Medvedev, *The Rise and Fall of T. D. Lysenko*, trans. I. Michael terner (New York: Columbia University Press, 1969), chaps. 2-3, 10.

17. C. Banc and Alan Dun des, *You Call This Living?: A Collection of East European Political Jokes* (Athens: University of Georgia Press, 1990), pp. 65, 86.

18. Igor Kon, "The Psychology of Social Inertia" (orig. Russian ed., 1988), *Social Sciences*, 20 (1989): 60-74. Quotation at p. 63.

19. Gennadii Batyagin, TASS, June 28, 1989. Quoted by Elizabeth Teague, "Perestroika and the Soviet Worker," *Government and Opposition*,

25 (Spring 1990): 192.

20. *Ibid.*, pp. 191-211.

۲۱. مصاحبه شخصی، لایبزیگ، ۶ دسامبر ۱۹۹۱

22. JirI Otava, "Public Opinion Research in Czechoslovakia," *Social Research*, 55 (Spring-Summer 1988): 249.

در تمامی شماره‌های بولتن‌های نظرسنجی منتشره در حکومت چکسلواکی این عبارت ذکر شده است: «ما به تمامی پژوهشگران یادآوری می‌کنیم که این بولتن برای استفاده عموم منتشر نشده است، و این بدان معناست که حتی دوستان و آشنایان نیز حق استفاده از آن را ندارند. [این اطلاعات] اختصاصاً مواد خام داخلی است برای کسانی که نظرسنجی انجام می‌دهند و آنانی که با ما همکاری می‌کنند.» (صفحه ۲۵۱، شماره ۲) برای دیدن شواهد مشابه از اتحاد جماهیر شوروی نگاه کنید به:

David Wedgwood Benn, *Persuasion and Soviet Politics* (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1989), especially chap. 4.

23. Waiter Friedrich and Hartmut Griese, *Jugend und Jugendforschung in der DDR: Gesellschaftspolitische Situationen, Sozialisation und Mentalitätsentwicklung in den achtziger Jahren* (Opladen: Leske & Budrich, 1991), pp. 139, 145.

۲۴. این پیمایش‌ها مبتنی بر مصاحبه‌های چهره به چهره هستند، که به همین دلیل باید در تفسیر ارقام دقیق آنها احتیاط کرد. از آنجا که شیوه‌های پیمایش تغییر نکرده‌اند، روندها معنادار هستند. اما تاحدی می‌توانند بازتاب‌دهنده کاهش ترس باشند.

25. Figures compiled in 1991 by Gallup-Hungary, Budapest, from *Jel kep*, the limited-circulation magazine of the Hungarian Institute of Public Opinion.

26. Classified survey of September 9, 1983. From the archives of the Public Opinion Research Institute, Prague.

27. Benn, *Persuasion and Soviet Politics*, p. 142.

۲۸. نقش تحریف ترجیح در این نتایج را نمی‌توان نادیده گرفت.

29. Ibid., pp. 153-154.

30. Henry O. Hart, "The Tables Turned: If East Europeans Could Vote," *Public Opinion*, 6 (October/November 1983): 53-57.

پیمایش‌های هارت چکسلواکی، مجارستان، لهستان، روانی و بلغارستان را پوشش می‌دهد.

31. Marek Ziolkowski, "Individuals and the Social System: Values, Perceptions, and Behavioral Strategies," *Social Research*, 55 (Spring/ Summer 1988): 139-177. The reported figures are drawn from pp. 153- 154.

32. Laszl Bruszt, " 'Without Us but for Us'? Political Orientation in Hungary in the Period of Late Paternalism," *Social Research*, 55 (Spring/Summer 1988): 43-76. The figures are from pp. 70, 72, and 75.

33. Elisabeth Noelle-Neumann, "The German Revolution: The Historic Experiment of the Division and Unification of a Nation as Reflected in Survey Findings," *International Journal of Public Opinion Research*, 3 (Autumn 1991): 248, table 4.

پیمایش آلمان شرقی در فوریه و مارس ۱۹۹۰ انجام شد و پیمایش آلمان غربی در دسامبر ۱۹۸۹

34. Ibid., p. 258, table 9.

پیمایش آلمان شرقی در ماه مارس ۱۹۹۰ انجام شد و پیمایش آلمان غربی دو ماه بعدتر.

35. Association for Independent Social Analysis, *Czechoslovakia January 1990 (Survey Report)*, March 1990, mimeo, table 4.

36. *Democracy, Economic Reform, and Western Assistance: Data Tables* (New York: Freedom House, 1991), table 154.
37. *Barometer of Privatization*, Szonda Ipsos, Budapest, October 1991, pp. 27-31.
38. Hans Aage, "Popular Attitudes and *Perestroika*," *Soviet Studies*, NO.43 (January 1991), especially pp. 8, 10.
- در مورد اتحاد شوروی، حداقل یک پیمایش نشان می‌داد که گرایش به بازار آزاد در آن تنها کمی کمتر از ایالات متحده است.
- See Robert J. Shiller, Maxim Boycko, and Vladimir Korobov, "Popular Attitudes toward Free Markets: The Soviet Union and the United States Compared," *American Economic Review*, 81 (June 1991): 385-400.
39. Vladimir Tismaneanu, *The Crisis of Marxist Ideology in Eastern Europe: The Poverty of Utopia* (London: Routledge, 1988), especially chap. 4; and Leszek Kolakowski, *Main Currents of Marxism: Its Origin, Growth, and Dissolution*, vol. 3, trans. P. S. Falla (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1978), especially chap. 13.
40. Vladimir Tismaneanu, *Reinventing Politics: Eastern Europe from Stalin to Ravel* (New York: Free Press, 1992), pp. 67-80.
41. *Ibid.*, pp. 90-106 .
42. Adam Michnik, *Letters from Prison and Other Essays*, trans. Maya Latynski (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1985; orig. Polish eds., 1973-1984), especially pp. 133-198.
43. Tismaneanu, *Reinventing Politics*, pp. 175-191.
۴۴. مواضع غیرواقع‌بینانه کمونیسم تجدیدنظرطلب اینجا بیان شده است:
- John Clark and Aaron Wildavsky, *The Moral Collapse of Communism: Poland as a Cautionary Tale* (San Francisco: ICS Press, 1990), especially chap. 3.
45. Janos Matyas Kovacs, "From Reformation to Transformation: Limits to Liberalism in Hungarian Economic Thought," *East European Politics and Societies*, 5 (Winter 1991): 41-72. Quotation at p. 47.
46. Vaclav Klaus and Tomas Jdek, "Social Criticism, False Liberalism, and Recent Changes in Czechoslovakia," *East European Politics and Societies*, 5 (Winter 1991): 26-40.

47. Janos Kornai, "The Hungarian Reform Process: Visions; Hopes, and Reality," *Journal of Economic Literature*, 24 (December 1986): 1728-1730.
48. Andrei D. Sakharov, *Progress, Coexistence, and Intellectual Freedom*, trans. *New York Times* (New York: W. W. Norton, 1968), pp. 72, 78.
49. Hankiss, "The 'Second Society.'" See also Di Palma, "Legitimation from the Top," pp. 64-67.
50. Vladimir Shlapentokh, *Soviet Public Opinion and Ideology: Mythology and Pragmatism in Interaction* (New York: Praeger, 1986); and Shlapentokh, *Public and Private Life of the Soviet People: Changing Values in Post-Stalin Russia* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1989).
۵۱. برای مشاهده یک تحلیل درباره آثار غربی همدلانه با کمونیسم، نگاه کنید به: Paul Hollander, *Political Pilgrims: Travels of Western Intellectuals to the Soviet Union, China, and Cuba, 1928-1978* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1981).
52. Jan Winiecki, *Resistance to Change in the Soviet Economic System: A Property Rights Approach* (London: Routledge, 1991), especially chaps. 1 and 2.
53. Janos Kornai, "Individual Freedom and Reform of the Socialist Economy," *European Economic Review*, 32 (March 1988): 259-262.

### ۱۴. شبیح محوناشدنی نژادپرستی سفیدپوستان

1. From a report of the Committee on Admissions and Enrollment, Academic Senate, University of California, *Freshman Admissions at Berkeley: A Policy for the 1990s and Beyond*. As recorded by Andrew Hacker, "Affirmative Action: The New Look," *New York Review of Books*, October 12, 1989, table A.
2. John Bunzel, "Affirmative Action: How It 'Works' at UC Berkeley," *Public Interest*, no. 93 (Fall 1988): 120.

۳. کالج‌ها به ندرت ارقام تفکیک‌نشده به لحاظ نژادی از پیش‌نیازهای پذیرش دانشجویان متقاضی ورود را منتشر می‌کنند، لذا آمارهای سراسری در دسترس ما قرار ندارند. آنچه در اختیار داریم اطلاعاتی درباره میانگین نمرات همه افرادی است که در آزمون SAT شرکت کرده‌اند، شامل کسانی که وارد کالج نمی‌شوند. در سال تحصیلی ۹۲-۱۹۹۱ میانگین نمرات سفیدپوستان در زبان و ریاضیات به ترتیب ۴۴۲ و ۴۹۱، و میانگین متناظر سیاه‌پوستان ۳۵۲ و ۳۸۵ بود.

College Entrance Examination Board, *National Report on College-Bound Seniors* (Princeton: CEEB, 1992).

4. Terry Eastland and William J. Bennett, *Counting by Race: Equality from the Founding Fathers to Bakke and Weber* (New York: Basic Books, 1979), pp. 8-9.
5. James Crouse and Dale Trusheim, *The Case against the SAT* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1988), especially chaps. 5, 8.
6. See statements recorded by Glynn Custred, "Onward to Adequacy," *Academic Questions*, 3 (Summer 1990): 64.
7. *Affirmative Action Newsletter*, Harvard University, Office of the Assistant to the President, Fall 1989. Quoted by Dinesh D'Souza, *Illiberal Education: The Politics of Race and Sex on Campus* (New York: Free Press, 1991), p. 220.
8. Stephen R. Barnett, "Who Gets In? A Troubling Policy," *Los Angeles Times*, June 11, 1992, p. B13.

ارقام مربوط به ثبت‌نام در دیگر پردیس‌های دانشگاهی در کالیفرنیا نیز نشان‌گر اختلاف مشابهی هستند. نگاه کنید به:

the *Economist*, September 17, 1994, p. 28.

9. *Economist*, February 16, 1991, p. 22. For many additional examples, see Stephen L. Carter, *Reflections of an Affirmative Action Baby* (New York: Basic Books, 1991), chap. 8; and D'Souza, *Illiberal Education*, chap. 5. For a defense of campus speech codes, see Stanley Fish, *There's No Such Thing as Free Speech ... And It's a*



- Good Thing, Too* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1994), chap. 8.
10. Sensitivity programs are debated in Paul Berman, ed., *Debating P.C.: The Controversy over Political Correctness on College Campuses* (New York: Laurel, 1992).
11. D'Souza, *Illiberal Education*, pp. 215-218.
12. This theme is developed by Shelby Steele, *The Content of Our Character: A New Vision of Race in America* (New York: St. Martin's Press, 1990).
۱۳. صرف رنج ناشی از تحقیر کسی را از یادگیری باز نمی‌دارد. بسیاری از اقلیت‌ها در جوامع گوناگونی که در آنها با دیده تحقیر به ایشان نگریسته می‌شده، خود را بر کشیده‌اند و حتی عملکرد بهتری از اکثریت ارائه داده‌اند. نگاه کنید به:
- Thomas Sowell, *Ethnic America: A History* (New York: Basic Books, 1981).
14. For examples see Charles J. Sykes, *The Hollow Men: Politics and Corruption in Higher Education* (Washington, D.C.: Regnery Gateway, 1990), p. 202; and Andrew Hacker, *Two Nations: Black and White, Separate, Hostile, Unequal* (New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1992), p. 159.
15. Much evidence is offered by Sykes, *Hollow Men*.
16. Christopher Shea, "Penn Report Faults Campus Police for Response to Students' Taking Papers," *Chronicle of Higher Education*, August 1993, 4, p. A27; and Shea, "Penn Won't Punish Black Students Who Threw Away Campus Papers," *Chronicle of Higher Education*, September 1993, 22, p. A35.
۱۷. جابجایی مفهومی اینجا مورد بحث قرار گرفته است:
- Hacker, *Two Nations*, chap. 10.
18. *Sources: Diversity Initiatives in Higher Education* (Washington, D.C.: American Council on Education, 1993).
19. Marcia Ascher, *Ethnomathematics: A Multicultural View of Mathematical Ideas* (Pacific Grove, Calif.: Brooks/Cole, 1991). See also the observations of Glenn M. Ricketts, "Multiculturalism Mobilizes," *Academic Questions*, 3 (Summer 1990): 57.
۲۰. طرح کلی منطق و اهداف چندفرهنگی اینجا ارائه شده است:
- Henry. Louis Gates, Jr., *Loose Canons: Notes on the Culture Wars* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1992; orig. publ., 1985-1991). Critical accounts include Arthur M. Schlesinger, Jr., *The Disuniting of America: Reflections on a Multicultural Society*

(Knoxville, Tenn.: Whittle Books, 1991); Diane Ravitch, "Multiculturalism: E Pluribus Plures," *American Scholar*, 59 (Summer 1990): 337-354; and Gary B. Nash, "The Great Multicultural Debate," *Contention*, 1 (Spring 1992): 1-28.

21. D'Souza, *Illiberal Education*, chap. 3.
22. As cited in *ibid.*, p. 8.
23. William A. Henry III, "Upside Down in the Groves of Academe," *Time*, April, 1991, p. 66.
24. D'Souza, *Illiberal Education*, pp. 148-151, 194-197; David P. Bryden, "It Ain't What They Teach, It's the Way They Teach It," *Public Interest*, no. 102 (Spring 1991): 44-45; and Chester E. Finn, "The Campus: An Island of Repression in a Sea of Freedom," *Commentary*, 88 (September 1989): 19.
25. Denise K. Magner, "When Whites Teach Black Studies: Controversy at Iowa State Dramatizes a Sensitive Issue on College Campuses," *Chronicle of Higher Education*, December 1, 1993, p. A19.
26. "Delaware U. Goes PC," *Washington Times*, June 14, 1991, p. F2.
27. Allan Bloom, *The Closing of the American Mind: How Higher Education Has Failed Democracy and Impoverished the Souls of Today's Students* (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1987), especially pp. 311, 324.
28. Richard Delgado, "The Imperial Scholar: Reflections on a Review of Civil Rights Literature," *University of Pennsylvania Law Review*, 132 (March 1984): 561-578.
29. *Ibid.*, p. 577.
30. Mari Matsuda, "Affirmative Action and Legal Knowledge: Planting Seeds in Plowed-Up Ground," *Harvard Women's Law Journal*, 11 (Spring 1-17): (1988). Quotations at pp. 1, 4-5.
31. Quoted by Randall L. Kennedy, "Racial Critiques of Legal Academia," *Harvard Law Review*, 102 (June 1989): 1752.
32. Nash, "The Great Multicultural Debate," p. 17.
33. As reported by Kennedy, "Racial Critiques," pp. 1798-1800.
34. Carter, *Reflections*, pp. 1-2.

۳۵. برای مشاهده مثال‌هایی از تحلیلی فوق‌العاده توسط کسانی که از خارج به موضوع نگرسته‌اند، نگاه کنید به:

Robert K. Merton, "Insiders and Outsiders: A Chapter in the Sociology of Knowledge," *American Journal of Sociology*, 77 (July 1972 ):9-47 .

مرتون برآوردی حاوی جزئیاتی درباره این اصل که گروه‌های خاص دسترسی انحصاری به اشکال خاصی از دانش دارند، انجام داده است. همچنین نگاه کنید به:

Glenn C. Loury, "Self-Censorship in Public Discourse: A Theory of 'Political Correctness' and Related Phenomena," *Rationality and Society*, 6 (October 1994): 428-461.

36. Kennedy, "Racial Critiques," p. 1807.

37. James S. Coleman, "On the Self-Suppression of Academic Freedom," *Academic Questions*, 4 (Winter 1990-91): 17-22.

38. Ibid., p. 20.

39. Jason DeParle, "Talk of Government Being Out to Get Blacks Falls on More Attentive Ears," *New York Times*, October 29, 1990, p. B7.

40. John E. Chubb and Terry M. Moe, *Politics, Markets, and America's Schools* (Washington, D.C.: Brookings Institution, 1990), especially chap. 1.

41. David S. Crystal and Harold W. Stevenson, "Mothers' Perceptions of Children's Problems with Mathematics: A Cross-National Comparison," *Journal of Educational Psychology*, 83 (September 1991): 372- 376.

42. See, for instance, T. R. Reid, "Miyazawa: Work Ethic Flags in U.S.," *Washington Post*, February 4, 1992, pp. A1, 11.

43. Steele, *Content of Our Character*, chap. 5. Quotations at pp. 78- 80, emphasis in original. For a similar thesis, see Hacker, *Two Nations*, chap. 4.

44. Jim Sleeper, *The Closest of Strangers: Liberalism and the Politics of Race in New York* (New York: W. W. Norton, 1990), p. 34.

۴۵. برای مشاهده بنیادهای نظری نگاه کنید به:

Mancur Olson, *The Logic of Collective Action: Public Goods and the Theory of Groups* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1965).

46. James M. Buchanan and Gordon Tullock, *The Calculus of Consent: Logical Foundations of Constitutional Democracy* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1962), chaps. 10-11.

## ۱۵. انقلابات سیاسی پیش‌بینی نشده

1. See Timur Kuran, "Sparks and Prairie Fires: A Theory of Unanticipated Political Revolution," *Public Choice*, 61 (April 1989): 41-74.
2. Cited by James DeNardo, *Power in Numbers: The Political Strategy of Protest and Rebellion* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1985), p. 17.

۳. تأثیربرانگیزترین بیان مارکس درباره این موضوع را اینجا می‌توان یافت:

*A Contribution to the Critique of Political Economy*, ed. Maurice Dobb, trans. S. W. Ryazanskaya (New York: International Publishers, 1970; first German ed., 1859), pp. 20-21. Jon Elster, *Making Sense of Marx* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985), pp. 428-446, critiques

Marx's pertinent writings.

4. For two influential statements, see James C. Davies, "Toward a Theory of Revolution," *American Sociological Review*, 27 (February 1962); and Ted R. Gurr, *Why Men Rebel* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1970).
5. David Snyder and Charles Tilly, "Hardship and Collective Violence in France, 1830 to 1960," *American Sociological Review*, 37 (October 1972): 520-532; and Charles Tilly, Louise Tilly, and Richard Tilly, *The Rebellious Century: 1830-1930* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1975). For much additional evidence against the theory of

relative deprivation, see Steven E. Finkel and James B. Rule, "Relative Deprivation and Related Psychological Theories of Civil Violence: A Critical Review," in *Research in Social Movements, Conflicts, and Change*, vol. 9, ed. Louis Kriesberg (Greenwich, Conn.: JAI Press, 1986), pp. 47-69.

6. Theda Skocpol, *States and Social Revolutions: A Comparative Analysis of France, Russia, and China* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1979). Another influential structural theory is the "demographic/ structural theory" of Jack A. Goldstone, *Revolution and Rebellion in the Early Modern World* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1991).

7. See also Mark I. Lichbach, *The Rebel's Dilemma* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1995). Lichbach's book contains a highly comprehensive critical survey of research on political revolutions.

۸. بخش C نیز همانند بخش A مشتمل بر دو نقطه تعادل است: ۱۰ و ۹۰. به همین دلیل است که انتظار مخالفت عمومی می‌تواند بر تحقق آن اثرگذار باشد. در مقابل A<sup>۱</sup> دارای تنها یک نقطه

### یادداشت‌ها ❖ ۳۰۳

تبادل در ۹۰ است. در شرایط A<sup>۱</sup> انتظارات عملاً بی‌تأثیر می‌شوند. تا زمانی که انتظار می‌رود مخالفت عمومی کمتر از ۱۰۰ باشد، این نقطه تعادل روی ۹۰ باقی خواهد ماند.

9. As cited in Mao Tse-Tung, "A Single Spark Can Start a Prairie Fire" (1930) in *Selected Military Writings of Mao Tse-Tung* (Beijing: Foreign Languages Press, 1972), pp. 65-76.

10. Assuming, for the sake of illustration, that the individuals all have the same expressive needs. .

11. See p. 166 for a definition of the former, p. 74 for a definition of the latter.

۱۱. تبیین مارکسیستی معیار اینجا به نقد کشیده شده است:

Martin Malia, *Comprendre la Revolution Russe* (Paris: Editions du Seuil, 1980), pp. 91- 93.

13. See William Henry Chamberlin, *The Russian Revolution, 1917- 1921*, vol. 1 (New York: Macmillan, 1935), pp. 62-63; and Malia, *Comprendre la Revolution Russe*, pp. 92-93.

14. Thomas Walton, "Economic Development and Revolutionary Upheavals in Iran," *Cambridge Journal of Economics*, 4 (September 1980): 271-292.

15. Baruch Fischhoff, "Hindsight" Foresight: The Effect of Outcome Knowledge on Judgment under Uncertainty," *Journal of Experimental Psychology: Human Perception and Performance*, 1 (August 1975): 288- 299; and Baruch Fischhoff and Ruth Beyth, "I Knew It Would Happen'-Remembered Probabilities of Once Future Things," *Organizational Behavior and Human Performance*, 13 (February 1975): 1-16.

## ۱۶. سقوط کمونیسم و دیگر براندازی‌های ناگهانی

1. Bernard Gwertzman and Michael T. Kaufman, eds., *The Collapse of Communism, by the Correspondents of "The New York Times"* (New York: Times Books, 1990), p. vii.

۲. برای دیدن یکی از نخستین شرح‌های این نظریه نگاه کنید به:

Hannah Arendt, *The Origins of Totalitarianism*, 2nd ed. (New York: World Publishing, 1958), pt. 3.

آرنت مشاهده کرد که کمونیسم موجب تضعیف پیوندهای خانوادگی، اجتماعی، مذهبی، و حرفه‌ای میان افراد می‌شود. او ادراک ادامه نشان داد که این موجب وابستگی وحشتناک افراد به دولت شده و بنابراین باعث جلوگیری از امکان بسیج توده‌ای می‌شود.

3. Richard Pipes, "Gorbachev's Russia: Breakdown or Crackdown?" *Commentary*, March 1990, p. 16.

4. Jeane J. Kirkpatrick, *The Withering Away of the Totalitarian State ... And Other Surprises* (Washington, D. C.: AEI Press, 1990). A decade earlier Kirkpatrick had proposed that the communist system was incapable

of self-propelled evolution. See her "Dictatorships and Double Standards," *Commentary*, November 1979, pp. 34-45.

5. Stephen R. Graubard, "Preface to the Issue 'Eastern Europe ... Central Europe ... Europe,'" *Daedalus*, 119 (Winter 1990): vi.

6. *Ibid.*, p. ii.

7. John Naisbitt, *Megatrends: Ten New Directions Transforming Our Lives* (New York: Warner Books, 1982).

8. *Economist*, November 18, 1989, p. 13.

9. See, for instance, Jack A. Goldstone, "Predicting Revolutions: Why We Could (and Should) Have Foreseen the Revolutions of 1989-1991 in the U.S.S.R. and Eastern Europe," *Contention*, 2 (Winter 1993): 127-152; Randall Collins, "Prediction in Macrosociology: The Case of the Soviet Collapse," *American Journal of Sociology*, 100 (May 1995): 1552-1593; and Susanne Lohmann, "The Dynamics of Informational Cascades: The Monday Demonstrations in Leipzig, East Germany, 1989-91," *World Politics*, 47 (October 1994): 42-101. Lohmann's analysis is largely consistent with the unpredictability of revolutions. Still, on page 91 of her paper she maintains that in 1989 East German political participation varied "in predictable ways."

10. Vaclav Havel, "The Power of the Powerless," in Havel et al., *The Power of the Powerless: Citizens against the State in Central-Eastern Europe*, ed. John Keane and trans. Paul Wilson (Armonk, N.Y.: M. E. Sharpe, 1985; orig. Czech ed., 1979), p. 42.
11. Ibid., pp. 87, 89, 96.
12. Vaclav Havel, "Meeting Gorbachev" (1987), in *Without Force or Lies: Voices from the Revolution of Central Europe in 1989-90*, ed. William M. Brinton and Alan Rinzler (San Francisco: Mercury House, 1990), pp. 266-267.
13. Vaclav Havel, "Cards on the Table" (1988), in *Without Force or Lies*, ed. Brinton and Rinzler, pp. 270-271.
14. Sidney Tarrow, "Aiming at a Moving Target": Social Science and the Recent Rebellions in Eastern Europe," *PS: Political Science and Politics*, 24 (March 1991): 12.

۱۵. درباره انتخابات و واکنش‌های متعاقب آن نگاه کنید به:

- the reports of John Taglibue, *New York Times*, June 3-6. The events leading up to the April accord have been chronicled and interpreted by Timothy Garton Ash, "Refolution: The Springtime of Two Nations," *New York Review of Books*, June 15, 1989, pp. 3-10. See also Elie Abel, *The Shattered Bloc: Behind the Upheaval in Eastern Europe* (Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1990), chap. 4.
16. East German Survey of the Institut fur Demoskopie Allensbach, February 17--March 15, 1990, Archive no. 4195 GEW.

۱۷. بنا به تجربه حاصل از آزمایشات روانشناسی، مغالطه من-می دانستم-این-اتفاق-می‌افتد در طول زمان بدتر هم خواهند شد. بنابراین می‌توان انتظار داشت که سهمی از شهروندان آلمان شرقی که سقوط کمونیسم را به‌مثابه یک شگفتی عنوان می‌کنند، در گذر زمان کاهش یابد. در واقع هنگامی که در ماه مارس ۱۹۹۱، یک سال پس از نخستین پیمایش و شانزده ماه پس از سقوط کمونیسم در آلمان شرقی، از شهروندان سؤال شد که «آیا دو سال قبل انتظار وقوع انقلاب را داشتید؟» ۷ درصد پاسخ دادند «بله» و ۳۳ درصد عنوان کردند «بله، ولی نه با این سرعت». میزان پاسخ‌دهندگانی که کاملاً از این اتفاق ابراز شگفت‌زدگی کرده بودند، به ۵۴ درصد کاهش یافته بود Allensbach Archives, Survey 5049

اما در ماه مارس ۱۹۹۳، هنگامی که از گروه نمونه‌ای سؤال شد که «آیا شما چهار سال قبل انتظار یک انقلاب مسالمت‌آمیز را داشتید؟» مقدار دو عدد نخست به‌ترتیب به ۴ و ۲۳ درصد کاهش

یافت، و سهم شهروندانی که از این رویداد ابراز شگفتی کامل می‌کردند، به ۷۰ درصد افزایش یافت

Allensbach Archives, Survey 5078

جالب اینجا بود که در سال ۱۹۹۱ هنگامی که سؤال اینگونه پرسیده شد که «اگر به دو سال پیش بازگردید، آیا انتظار سقوط رژیم کمونیستی در جمهوری دموکراتیک آلمان را داشتید یا از این موضوع شگفت‌زده می‌شوید؟» میزان پاسخ‌های مثبت به‌شکل قابل‌توجهی بیشتر بود. با این تغییر در نحوه پرسش ۲۰ درصد پاسخ دادند «بله»، ۴۷ درصد «بله، ولی نه به این سرعت»، و تنها ۲۸ درصد اذعان داشتند که «شگفت‌زده شدیم». تفاوت میان این دو نسخه از پرسش این بود که در اولی پرسیده می‌شد آیا پرسش‌شوندگان انتظار سقوط مسالمت‌آمیز کمونیسم را داشتند، و در دومی صرفاً سؤال می‌شد آیا انتظار سقوط کمونیسم را داشتند یا خیر. از نسخه اخیر پرسش در پیمایش‌های ۱۹۹۰ تا ۱۹۹۳ استفاده نشده بود.

18. For a compilation of pertinent reports from the *New York Times*, see Gwertzman and Kaufman, *The Collapse of Communism*, pp. 153-184. Eyewitness accounts include Timothy Garton Ash, "The German Revolution," *New York Review of Books*, December 21, 1989, pp. 14-19; and George Paul Csicsery, "The Siege of N6gnidi Street, Budapest,

1989," in *Without Force or Lies*, ed. Brinton and Rinzler, pp. 289-302.

19. Andrei Amalrik, *Will the Soviet Union Survive until 1984?* (New York: Harper & Row, 1970; orig. Russian ed., 1969), especially pp. 36-44.

20. Vladimir Tismaneanu, "Personal Power and Political Crisis in Romania," *Government and Opposition*, 24 (Spring 1989): 193-194.

21. For details, see Robert C. Tucker, *Political Culture and Leadership in Soviet Russia: From Lenin to Gorbachev* (New York: Norton, 1987), chap. 7.

22. Walter Friedrich and Hartmut Griesse, *Jugend und Jugendforschung in der DDR: Gesellschaftspolitische Situationen, Sozialisation und Mentalitätsentwicklung in den achtziger Jahren* (Opladen: Leske & Budrich, 1991), pp. 139, 145.

۲۳. اعداد در سال ۱۹۹۱ توسط گالوپ-مجارستان جمع‌آوری شده‌اند.

۲۴. متقابلاً درصد کسانی که معتقد بودند گرایش به‌نفع‌جویی سرمایه‌داری در حال تغییر است، از ۱۸ درصد به ۴۲ درصد افزایش یافت.

Surveys of September 9, 1983, and June 14, 1989, from the archives of the Public Opinion Research Institute, Prague.



25. *Economist*, July 18, 1987, p. 45.
26. Z [Martin Malia], "To the Stalin Mausoleum," *Daedalus*, 119 (Winter 1990): 332.
27. Recorded by Daniel Bell, "As We Go into the Nineties: Some Outlines of the Twenty-First Century," *Dissent*, 37 (Spring 1990): 173.
28. *Economist*, July 18, 1987, p. 45.
29. Timothy Garton Ash, "Germany Unbound," *New York Review of Books*, November 22, 1990, p. 12.
۳۰. گورباچف در روایت پس‌نگرانه‌اش نوشت: «البته که ما بلافاصله نفهمیدیم چقدر باید به پیش برویم و چه تغییرات اساسی مورد نیاز است.» نگاه کنید به: Mikhail Gorbachev, *The August Coup* (New York: HarperCollins, 1991), p. 104.
31. See Vladimir Tismaneanu, *Reinventing Politics: Eastern Europe from Stalin to Ravel* (New York: Free Press, 1992), pp. 179-191.
32. Albert O. Hirschman, "Exit, Voice, and the Fate of the German Democratic Republic: An Essay in Conceptual History," *World Politics*, 45 (January 1993): 192; and Jens Reich, "Reflections on Becoming an East German Dissident, on Losing the Wall and a Country," in *Spring in Winter: The 1989 Revolutions*, ed. Gwyn Prins (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1990), pp. 80-81.
33. Reich, "Reflections," p. 86.
34. Peter Voss in a personal interview, Leipzig, December 6, 1991.
35. Karl-Dieter Opp, "Spontaneous Revolutions: The Case of East Germany in 1989," in *German Unification and European Integration*, ed. Heinz Kurz (London: Edward Elgar, 1992), table 1.
- نظر تحلیل‌گران درباره اینکه آیا تعداد تظاهرکنندگان به صورت یکنواخت رشد کرد یا نه، با یکدیگر متفاوت است. اگر شمار مشارکت‌کنندگان در فاصله دو دوشنبه متوالی کاهش می‌یافت، این سقوط می‌توانست بازتاب‌دهنده تغییر برآوردها در این باره باشد که رویدادها به کجا منتهی خواهند شد.
36. For additional accounts and interpretations, see Ash, "The German Revolution"; Edith Anderson, "Town Mice and Country Mice," in *Without Force or Lies*, ed. Brinton and Rinzler, pp. 170-192; and the *New York Times* reports compiled in Gwertzman and Kaufman, *Collapse of Communism*, pp. 158-160, 166-184, and 216-222.

37. Bill Keller, "In Moscow, Tone Is a Studied Calm," *New York Times*, August 18, 1989, p. A6.
38. Henry Kamm, "Communist Party in Hungary Votes for Radical Shift," *New York Times*, October 8, 1989, pp. A1, A18. For a fuller account of the transformation, see Abel, *Shattered Bloc*, chap. 2.
39. Bill Keller, "Gorbachev, in Finland, Disavows Any Right of Regional Intervention," *New York Times*, October 26, 1989, pp. A1, A12.
40. For an eyewitness account of these events, see Timothy Garton Ash, "The Revolution of the Magic Lantern," *New York Review of Books*, January 18, 1990, pp. 42-51. See also Abel, *Shattered Bloc*, chap. 3.
41. *Economist*, December 2, 1989, p. 55.
42. See Timur Kuran, "Sparks and Prairie Fires: A Theory of Unanticipated Political Revolution," *Public Choice*, 61 (April 1989): 41-74.
۴۳. بدون شک روند وقایع نیز عاملی بود که موجب شکست محافظه‌کاران شوروی در سد کردن آزادسازی اروپای شرقی شد. اگر وقایع با سرعت کمتری روی می‌دادند، آنها زمان کافی برای برکنار کردن گورباچف و واداشتن ارتش سرخ به عمل را در اختیار می‌داشتند.
44. "Czechoslovakia: The Velvet Revolution," *Uncaptive Minds*, 3 (January-February 1990): 11.
45. William H. Kaempfer and Anton D. Lowenberg, "Using Threshold Models to Explain International Relations," *Public Choice*, 73 (June 1992): 436.
46. For the *New York Times* reports of these events, see Gwertzman and Kaufman, *Collapse of Communism*, pp. 332-339. A detailed account is provided by Matei Calinescu and Vladimir Tismaneanu, "The 1989 Revolution and Romania's Future," *Problems of Communism*, 40 (January-April 1991): 42-59.
47. Jan Urban, "Czechoslovakia: The Power and Politics of Humiliation," in *Spring in Winter*, ed. Prins, p. 132.
48. See the references in note 9 in this chapter, and also] F. Brown, *Surge to Freedom: The End of Communist Rule in Eastern Europe* (Durham, N.C.: Duke University Press, 1991); Mark Frankland, *The Patriots' Revolution: How Eastern Europe Topped Communism and Won Its Freedom* (Chicago: Ivan R. Dee, 1992); and Sabrina R. Ramet, *Social Currents in Eastern Europe: The Sources and Meaning of the Great Transformation* (Durham, N.C.: Duke University Press, 1991).

49. For fuller and additional details, see Kuran, “Sparks and Prairie Fires.”
50. Alexis de Tocqueville, *The Old Regime and the French Revolution*, trans. Stuart Gilbert (New York: Doubleday, 1955; first French ed., 1856), especially pp. 138-148.
51. William Doyle, *Origins of the French Revolution*; 2nd ed. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1988), p. 84.
52. *Ibid.*, pp. 83-84.
53. Tocqueville, *Old Regime*, p. 20.
54. Richard Cobb, “The Beginning of the Revolutionary Crisis in Paris” (1967) and “Revolutionary Situations in France, 1789-1968” (1968), in his *A Second Identity: Essays on France and French History* (London: Oxford University Press, 1969), pp. 145-158, 267-281.
55. Samuel F. Scott, *The Response of the Royal Army to the French Revolution: The Role and Development of the Line Army, 1787-93* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1978), chap. 2, especially pp. 46-59.
56. Tocqueville, *Old Regime*, p. 175.
57. Cobb, “Revolutionary Situations,” p. 272.
58. Fereydzoun Hoveyda, *The Fall of the Shah*, trans. Roger Liddell (New York: Wyndham Books, 1980; orig. ed., 1979), pp. 15-17; and Marvin Zonis, “Iran: A Theory of Revolution from Accounts of the Revolution,” *World Politics*, 35 (July 1983): 602.
59. Mohamed Heikal, *Iran: The Untold Story* (New York: Pantheon, 1982; orig. ed., 1981), p. 123.
60. Hoveyda, *Fall of the Shah*, pp. 35-38.
61. For this blunder, they were sacked in a meeting held in Prague. See Heikal, *Iran*, p. 156.
62. Shaul Bakhash, *The Reign of the Ayatollahs: Iran and the Islamic Revolution* (New York: Basic Books, 1984), p. 45.
63. Heikal, *Iran*, p. 157.
64. Nikki R. Keddie, “Can Revolutions Be Predicted; Can Their Causes Be Understood?” *Contention*, 1 (Winter 1992): 159-160.

65. Ibid., p. 160.  
66. Hoveyda, *Fall of the Shah*, pp. 102-103, 117.  
67. Bakhash, *Reign of the Ayatollahs*, pp. 41-42.  
68. Ibid., pp. 13-14.

۶۹. بیشتر شواهد اینجا ارائه شده‌اند:

Leopold Haimson, "The Problem of Social Stability in Urban Russia, 1905-1917," in *The Structure of Russian History: Interpretive Essays*, ed. Michael Cherniavsky (New York: Random House, 1970), pp. 341-380; and Hans Rogger, "Russia in 1914," *Journal of Contemporary History*, 1 (October 1966): 95-119.

هر یک از این مقالات همچنین چشم‌اندازی کلی از نشانه‌های متضاد ثبات و عدم ثبات در روسیه پیش از ۱۹۱۷ ارائه می‌دادند.

70. Leonard Schapiro, *The Russian Revolutions of 1917: The Origins of Modern Communism* (New York: Basic Books, 1984), p. 19.  
71. Schapiro, *Russian Revolutions*, p. 39; and William Henry Chamberlin, *The Russian Revolution, 1917-1921*, vol. 1 (New York: Macmillan, 1935), p. 73.  
72. Chamberlin, *Russian Revolution*, vol. 1, p. 76.  
73. Ibid., pp. 73-77.  
74. Ibid., p. 73.  
75. Ibid., chap. 3.

۷۶. برای بررسی راهبرد بیسمارک نگاه کنید به:

Martin Malia, *Comprendre la Revolution Russe* (Paris: Editions du Seuil, 1980), especially chap. 1.

جزء اضافی این راهبرد، امتیاز دادن برای ملایم‌تر کردن مخالفت‌ها بود، همانند زمانی که الکساندر دوم دهقانان را آزاد کرد.

77. Chamberlin, *Russian Revolution*, vol. 1, pp. 74-80; and Warren B. Walsh, "The Petrograd Garrison and the February Revolution of 1917," in *New Dimensions in Military History: An Anthology*, ed. Russell F. Weigley (San Rafael, Calif.: Presidio Press, 1975), pp. 267-269.  
78. Chamberlin, *Russian Revolution*, vol. 1, p. 75; and Walsh, "Petrograd Garrison," pp. 267-273.

79. Paul Kecskemeti, *The Unexpected Revolution: Social Forces in the Hungarian Uprising* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1961), p. 1.
80. Ibid., pp. 60, 84-85.
81. Vaclav Havel, *Disturbing the Peace: A Conversation with Karel Hviiiaala*, trans. Paul Wilson (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1990; orig. Czech ed., 1986), p. 109.
82. Timothy Garton Ash, "Eastern Europe: The Year of Truth," *New York Review of Books*, February 15, 1990, pp. 17-22.
83. Theodore Draper, "A New History of the Velvet Revolution," *New York Review of Books*, January 14, 1993, p. 18.
84. Quoted in Celestine Bohlen, "In Post-Communist Europe, Culture Takes aFall," *Herald Tribune*, November 14, 1990, p. 1.
۸۵. اطلاعات درباره مجارستان توسط آدام لوندل، مدیر شرکت نظرسنجی سزوندا ایسوس، در خلال مصاحبه‌ای در ۱۳ دسامبر ۱۹۹۱ در بوداپست مهیا شد. اطلاعات مربوط به چکسلواکی بر مبنای جداولی است که توسط مؤسسه تحقیقات افکار عمومی تهیه شده است.
86. Adam Michnik, "An Embarrassing Anniversary," *New York Review of Books*, June 10, 1993, pp. 19-21.
87. Hannah Arendt, *On Revolution* (New York: Penguin, 1965; orig. ed., 1963), pp. 88-109.
88. Ray A. Medvedev, *Let History Judge: The Origins and Consequences of Stalinism*, trans. Colleen Taylor (New York: Vintage, 1973; orig. Russian ed., 1968), chaps. 2-8; and Robert Conquest, *The Great Terror: A Reassessment* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1990).
89. Said Amir Arjomand, "Iran's Islamic Revolution. in Comparative Perspective," *World Politics*, 38 (April 1986), especially pp. 392, 402.
90. Shahrugh Akhavi, *Religion and Politics in Contemporary Iran: Clergy-State Relations in the Pahlavi Period* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1980); pp. 168-180.
۹۱. درباره آسیب‌پذیری رژیم‌های انقلابی انگاه کنید به:  
Stephen M. Walt, "Revolution and War," *World Politics*, 44 (April 1992): 321- 368.
92. Bakhsh, *Reign of the Ayatollahs*, pp; 219-224.
93. Friedrich Engels to Heinz Starkenburg, January 25, 1894. As quoted in Pat-

rick Gardiner, *The Nature of Historical Explanation* (London: Oxford University Press, 1952), p. 100.

94. Vladimir Ilyich Lenin, "What Is to Be Done?" (1902), in *The Lenin Anthology*, ed. Robert C. Tucker (New York: Norton, 1975), pp. 12- 114.
95. Tocqueville, *Old Regime*, p. 13.
96. Havel, *Disturbing the Peace*, p. 123. Similar sentiments are expressed on p. 144.
97. Charles Tilly, *From Mobilization to Revolution* (Reading, Mass.: Addison-Wesley, 1978).
98. Pamela E. Oliver, "Bringing the Crowd Back In: The Nonorganizational Elements of Social Movements," *Research in Social Movements, Conflict, and Change*, vol. 11, ed. Louis Kriesberg (Greenwich, Conn.: JAI Press, 1989), pp. 1-30. See also Sidney Tarrow, *Democracy and disorder: Protest and Politics in Italy, 1965-1975* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1989).

## ۱۷. پیچیدگی‌های پنهان تحول اجتماعی

1. Richard R. Nelson and Sidney G. Winter, *An Evolutionary Theory of Economic Change* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1982); and Ulrich Witt, ed., *Evolutionary Economics* (Aldershot, U.K.: Edward Elgar, 1993).
  2. W. Brian Arthur, *Increasing Returns and Path Dependence in the Economy* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1994); and M. Mitchell Waldrop, *Complexity: The Emerging Science at the Edge of Order and Chaos* (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1992).
  3. Charles Darwin, *On the Origin of Species* (London: John Murray, 1859); and Stephen Jay Gould, *Wonderful Life: The Burgess Shale and the Nature of History* (New York: W. W. Norton, 1989).
  4. W. Russell Neuman, *The Paradox of Mass Politics: Knowledge and Opinion in the American Electorate* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1986), p. 189.
  5. Ranee Crain, "Media Seers Clouding the Picture," *Advertising Age*, April 6, 1992, p. 25A; Robert A. Brusca, "Recession or Recovery?" *Challenge*, July-August 1992, pp. 4-15; and Robert D. Hershey, Jr., "This Just In: Recession Ended 21 Months Ago," *New York Times*, December 1992, 23, pp. D1, D3.
۶. آراء بوش در کالیفرنیا ۱۹ درصد کاهش یافت، در حالی که این کاهش آراء در سطح ملی ۱۵ درصد بود. در نوامبر ۱۹۹۲، نرخ بیکاری در کالیفرنیا به ۹٫۳ درصد رسید، در حالی که این رقم در نوامبر ۱۹۸۸ ۴٫۸ بود.
7. For a more technical presentation and further details, see Timur Kuran, "Cognitive Limitations and Preference Evolution," *Journal of Institutional and Theoretical Economics*, 147 (June 1991): 241-273.
۸. آستانه e از ۵۰ به ۵۵ افزایش خواهد یافت، و آستانه c از ۵۵ به ۵۰ کاهش خواهد یافت.
۹. این تغییرات می‌توانند آنهایی باشند که افراد را تحت تأثیر قرار می‌دهند. به توالی E بازگردیم و فرض کنیم افکار عمومی بر روی ۵۰ قرار گرفته است. اگر آستانه e از ۵۰ به ۵۵ افزایش یابد، افکار عمومی به‌ناگاه به ۱۰۰ پرتاب خواهد شد. اکنون فرض کنید که این آستانه به ۵۰ بازگردد و E بازیابی شود. افکار عمومی بر روی ۱۰۰ باقی خواهد ماند.
10. This theme is developed at length in William H. Rickett, *Liberalism against Populism: A Confrontation between the Theory of Democracy and the Theory of Social Choice* (San Francisco: W. H. Freeman, 1982). For many additional insights, see Thniinn Eggertsson, *Economic Behavior and Institutions* (New York: Cambridge

University Press, 1990), chaps. 6-10.

11. Gordon Tullock, *Toward a Mathematics of Politics* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1967), chap. 3; and Kenneth A. Shepsle and Barry R. Weingast, "Structure-Induced Equilibrium and Legislative Choice," *Public Choice*, 37 (1981): 503-519.
  12. F. C. Bartlett, *Remembering* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1932), especially chap. 8. For further evidence, see Nelson and Winter, *An Evolutionary Theory of Economic Change*, p. 112; and Ronald A. Heiner, "Imperfect Decisions and the Law: On the Evolution of Legal Precedent and Rules," *Journal of Legal Studies*, 15 (June 1986):227-261 .
  13. Alan J. Parkin, *Memory and Amnesia: An Introduction* (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1987).
  14. Herbert A. Simon, *Reason in Human Affairs* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1983), elaborates on obstacles to imagining contingencies, and Michael Polanyi, *The Tacit Dimension* (Gloucester, Mass.: Peter Smith, 1983; orig. ed., 1966), on those to articulating full justifications. Evidence pertaining to the enforcement and evolution of the law is offered by Ronald Dworkin, *Law's Empire* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1986); and Edward H. Levi, *An Introduction to Legal Reasoning* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1948).
۱۵. برای شواهدی از تفسیر خودمحور از سمت قضات، و بسیاری دیگر از بینش‌ها که آنچه را در اینجا گفتیم تکمیل می‌کنند، نگاه کنید به:
- Thomas J. Miceli and Metin Cosgel, "Reputation and Judicial Decision-Making," *Journal of Economic Behavior and Organization*, 23 (January 1994 ): 31- 51.
16. Magoroh Maruyama, "The Second Cybernetics: Deviation-Amplifying Mutual Causal Processes," *American Scientist*, 51 (March 1963): 164-179.
  17. David Hackett Fischer, *Historians' Fallacies: Toward a Logic of Historical Thought* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1971), p. 178.
  18. R. W. Apple, Jr., "Opposition Calls for Vote and Gains Access to a More Open Press," *New York Times*, November 29, 1989, p. A1.
  19. Alfred Marshall, *Principles of Economics: An Introductory Volume*, 8th ed. (London: Macmillan, 1936), p. iii.
  20. Darwin, *Origin of Species*.
  21. Joel Mokyr, *The Lever of Riches: Technological Creativity and Economic Progress*



- (New York: Oxford University Press, 1990), p. 273.
22. Niles Eldredge and Stephen Jay Gould, "Punctuated Equilibria: An Alternative to Phyletic Gradualism," in *Models in Paleobiology*, ed. Thomas J. M. Schopf (San Francisco: Freeman, Cooper & Co., 1972), pp. 82-115; and Niles Eldredge, *Time Frames: The Evolution of Punctuated Equilibria* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1985).
23. Gould, *Wonderful Life*.
24. David M. Raup, *Extinction: Bad Genes or Bad Luck?* (New York: W. W. Norton, 1991).
25. Mokyr, *Lever of Riches*, pt. 4.
26. W. Brian Arthur, "Competing Technologies, Increasing Returns, and Lock-In by Historical Events," *Economic Journal*, 99 (March 1989): 116-131; and Paul A. David, "The Hero and the Herd in Technological History: Reflections on Thomas Edison and the Battle of the Systems," in *Favorites of Fortune: Technology, Growth, and Economic Development since the Industrial Revolution*, ed. Patrice Higonnet, David S. Landes, and Henry Rosovsky (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1991), pp. 72-119.
27. Gustave Le Bon, *The Crowd: A Study of the Popular Mind* (Atlanta: Cherokee Publishing Co., 1982; first French ed., 1895), pp. 65, 72.
28. *Ibid.*, p. 68.
29. Anthony Pratkanis and Elliot Aronson, *Age of Propaganda: The Everyday Use and Abuse of Persuasion* (New York: W. H. Freeman; 1992), pp. 206-215.
30. Abbe J. A. Dubois, *Hindu Manners, Customs, and Ceremonies*, 3rd ed., trans. Henry K. Beauchamp (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1906; first French ed., 1815), p. 28.
۳۱. آخرین مغالطه، تمرکز نقد ف. ا. هایک بر ساختارگرایی است. نگاه کنید به:
- Law, Legislation, and Liberty*, vol. 1: *Rules and Order* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1973), chaps. 1 and 3.
32. R. H. Tawney, *Religion and the Rise of Capitalism* (Gloucester, Mass.: Peter Smith, 1962; orig. ed., 1926), especially pp. 79-102.
33. Robert K. Merton, "The Unanticipated Consequences of Purposive Social Action," *American Sociological Review*, 1 (December 1936): 894- 904; Hayek, *Law*,

*Legislation, and Liberty*, vol. 1, chaps. 1 and 3; and Raymond Boudon, *The Unintended Consequences of Social Action* (New York: St. Martin's Press, 1982; orig. French ed., 1977).

34. Mark Granovetter, "Economic Action and Social Structure: The Problem of Etnbeddedness," *American Journal of Sociology*, 91 (November 1985): 481-510; and Gregory Dow, "The Function of Authority in Transaction Cost Economics," *Journal of Economic Behavior and Organization*, 8 (March 1987): 13-38.
35. Mancur Olson, *The Logic of Collective Action: Public Goods and the Theory of Groups* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1965).

۳۶. این نتایج همراستا هستند با تفاسیر تاریخی جونز. نگاه کنید به:

E. L. Jones, *Growth Recurring: Economic Change in World History* (Oxford: Clarendon Press,-1988).

۳۷. تحت شرایط E، فایده ذاتی a عبارت است از  $100 - 150 - 80 = 70$ . با تغییر به E2 به این صورت درمی‌آید:  $100 - 1100 - 80 = 80$ .

37. Under E, a's intrinsic utility is  $100 - 150 - 80 = 70$ . With the shift to E2, it becomes  $100 - 1100 - 80 = 80$ .

38. Gould, *Wonderful Life*; and Raup, *Extinction*.

39. Gould, *Wonderful Life*, p. 318.

## ۱۸. از برده‌داری تا تبعیض مثبت

1. Alexis de Tocqueville, *Democracy in America*, vol. 2, ed. Henry Reeve, Francis Bowen, and Phillips Bradley (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1989 ; orig. French ed., 1835), chap. 18.
  2. See, for instance, Jay R. Mandle, *Not Slave, Not Free: The African American Economic Experience since the Civil War* (Durham, N.C.: Duke University Press, 1992), chaps. 4-5.
  3. Robert William Fogel, *Without Consent or Contract: The Rise and Fall of American Slavery* (New York: W. W. Norton, 1989), chaps. 4-5.
- جنوب در تمامی شاخص‌های پیشرفت مادی با شمال کاملاً برابری نمی‌کرد. به‌عنوان مثال سوءتغذیه مادران باردار در جنوب بیش از شمال بود، زیرا بردگان باردار باید تقریباً تا زمان تولد طفل به کار کردن ادامه می‌دادند.
4. Stanley L. Engerman, "Slavery and Emancipation in Comparative Perspective: A Look at Some Recent Debates," *Journal of Economic History*, 46 (June 1986): 327.
  5. Fogel, *Without Consent or Contract*, pp. 322, 369, 382.
  6. *Ibid.*, pp. 328-329.
- ۷- این کارزار توجیهات فکری‌اش را از ادبیاتی کسب می‌کرد که هدفش نشان دادن فرودستی طبیعی سیاهان نسبت به سفیدپوستان بود. نگاه کنید به:
- Stephen Jay Gould, *The Mismeasure of Man* (New York: W. W. Norton, 1981).
8. Russel B. Nye, *Fettered Freedom: Civil Liberties and the Slavery Controversy, 1830-1860* (East Lansing: Michigan State College Press, 1949 ), especially chaps. 3-5.
  9. William W. Freehling, *Prelude to Civil War: The Nullification Controversy in South Carolina, 1816-1836* (New York: Harper & Row, 1966 ), p. 110.
  10. Merton L. Dillon, *The Abolitionists: The Growth of a Dissenting Minority* (De Kalb: Northern Illinois University Press, 1974), p. 49.
  11. Fogel, *Without Consent or Contract*, p. 326.
  12. *Ibid.*, pp. 413-414.
  13. *Ibid.*, pp. 414-416.
  14. William H. Riker, *Liberalism against Populism: A Confrontation between the Theory of Democracy and the Theory of Social Choice* (San Francisco: W. H. Freeman, 1982), chap. 9; and Barry R. Weingast, "Institutions

- and Political Commitment: A New Political Economy of the American Civil War Era” {unpublished manuscript, Stanford University, 1994 }, pt. 4.
15. Don E. Fehrenbacher, *The Dred Scott Case: Its Significance in American Law and Politics* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1978), pp. 89-100.
16. J. R. Pole, *The Pursuit of Equality in American History* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1978), pp. 148-149. For an interpretation of Lincoln’s comments on equality, see David Zarefsky, *Lincoln, Douglas, and Slavery: In the Crucible of Public Debate* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1990), pp. 78-80, 242-244.
17. George M. Frederickson, *The Black Image in the White Mind: The Debate on Afro-American Character and Destiny, 1817-1914* (New York: Harper & Row, 1971), chap. 1.
18. Stanley N. Katz, “The Strange Birth and Unlikely History of Constitutional Equality,” *Journal of American History*, 75 (December 1988): 747-762
19. James Madison, “The Federalist no. 10” (1787), in Alexander Hamilton, James Madison, and John Jay, *The Federalist Papers*, ed. Jacob E. Cooke (Middletown, Conn.: Wesleyan University Press, 1961; orig. pub., 1787-88), p. 59. I owe the observation to Pole, *Pursuit of Equality*, pp. 121-122.
20. Pole, *Pursuit of Equality*, pp. 13-26.
21. David Brion Davis, *The Problem of Slavery in Western Culture* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1966), pt. 1; and Bernard Lewis, *Race and Slavery in the Middle East: An Historical Enquiry* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1990).
22. Pole, *Pursuit of Equality*, p. 117.
23. Katz, “Strange Birth,” especially pp. 753-755. See also Pole, *Pursuit of Equality*, chaps. 6-7; and Terry Eastland and William J. Bennett, *Counting by Race: Equality from the Founding Fathers to Bakke and Weber* (New York: Basic Books, 1979), chaps. 2-3.
24. Eastland and Bennett, *Counting by Race*, chap. 5; Pole, *Pursuit of Equality*, chap. 7; and Robert Higgs, *Competition and Coercion: Blacks in the American Economy, 1865-1914* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1977).

۲۵. برای مشاهده نکته‌های مشابه، با تمرکز بر روابط اجاره‌داری در کشاورزی، نگاه کنید به:

- Lee J. Alston and Joseph P. Ferrie, “Social Control and Labor Relations in the American South before the Mechanization of the Cotton Harvest in the 1950s,” *Journal of Institutional and Theoretical Economics*, 145 (March 1989): 133-157;

- and Lee J. Alston, "Race Etiquette in the South: The Role of Tenancy," in *Research in Economic History*, vol. 10, ed. Paul Uselding (Greenwich, Conn.: JAI Press, 1986), pp. 200"-201 .
26. Hortense Powdermaker, *After Freedom: A Cultural Study in the Deep South* (New York: Viking, 1939), especially chap. 16.
27. Richard Wright, *Black Boy: A Record of Childhood and Youth* (New York: Harper & Row, 1945), p. 253. As recorded in Mandel, *Not Slave, Not Free*, p. 62.
28. Dennis Chong, *Collective Action and the Civil Rights Movement* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1991), p. 97.
29. Thomas Sowell, *Preferential Policies: An International Perspective* (New York: William Morrow, 1990), p. 126 (emphasis added). For the early history of affirmative action, see Nathan Glazer, *Affirmative Discrimination: Ethnic Inequality and Public Policy*, rev. ed. (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1987), chaps. 2-4; and Herman Belz, *Equality Transformed: A Quarter-Century of Affirmative Action* (New Brunswick, N.J.: Transaction Publishers, 1992), chaps. 1-2.
30. Godfrey Hodgson, quoted in Chong, *Collective Action*, p. 224.
31. Fogel, *Without Consent or Contract*, p. 204.
32. Pole, *Pursuit of Equality*, pp. 178-180.
33. Belz, *Equality Transformed*, pp. 8-12.
34. For detailed accounts of these cases, see *ibid.*, chaps. 2, 6-7.
35. *Ibid.*, especially chap. 3.
36. Abigail M. Thernstrom, *Whose Votes Count? Affirmative Action and Minority Voting Rights* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1987).
37. J. W. Peltason, *Fifty-Eight Lonely Men: Southern Federal Judges and School Desegregation* (New York: Harcourt, Brace and World, 1961 ), pp. 12-14, 96-97.
38. D. Garth Taylor, *Public Opinion and Collective Action: The Boston School Desegregation Conflict* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1986), chap. 6.
39. Peter Brimelow and Leslie Spencer, "When Quotas Replace Merit, Everybody Suffers," *Forbes*, February 15, 1993, pp. 80-102.
40. Timur Kuran, "Seeds of Racial Explosion," *Society*, 30 (September/ October

1993): 55-67.

41. Marc Galanter, *Competing Equalities: Law and the Backward Classes in India* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1984); Andre Beteille, *The Backward Classes in Contemporary India* (Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1992); and Thomas Sowell, *Preferential Policies: An International Perspective* (New York: William Morrow, 1990), especially pp. 91-103.
42. Beteille, *Backward Classes*, p. 74.
43. Dharma Kumar, "The Affirmative Action Debate in India," *Asian Survey*, 32 (March 1992): 290-302.
44. *Ibid.*, p. 294.
45. *Ibid.*, p. 301.

## ۱۹. تحریف ترجیح و تحلیل‌های اجتماعی

1. Henri Poincare, *Science and Hypothesis* (New York: Dover Publications, 1952 ; orig. French ed., 1902), p. 173.

۲. ساختارشکنی توسط ژاک دریدا در دهه ۱۹۶۰ آغاز شد. یکی از آثار معرف این مکتب عبارت است از:

*Writing and Difference*, trans. Alan Bass (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1978; first French ed., 1967). For a survey, see Christopher Norris, *Deconstruction: Theory and Practice*, rev. ed. (London: Routledge, 1991).

3. Clifford Geertz, "Thick Description: Toward an Interpretive Theory of Culture," in his *The Interpretation of Cultures* (New York: Basic Books, 1973), pp. 3-30.

4. Paul Veyne, *Writing History: Essay on Epistemology*, trans. Mina Moore-Rinvolucri (Middletown, Conn.: Wesleyan University Press, 1984 ; orig. French ed., 1971), pp. 151-153. For a similar perspective, see Edward Hallett Carr, *What Is History?* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1962), especially chap. 1.

۵. گروه اول اصولاً مشتمل است بر اقتصاددانان نئوکلاسیک. گروه اخیر عمدتاً جامعه‌شناسان و دانشمندان علوم سیاسی هستند، اما برخی اقتصاددانان خارج از مکتب نئوکلاسیک را نیز شامل می‌شوند. چند نمونه از آثار برجسته سنت ساختارگرایی در فصل ۱۵ مورد نقد قرار گرفته‌اند.

6. Andrew S. McFarland, as quoted by Jon Elster, *Ulysses and the Sirens: Studies in Rationality and Irrationality* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1979), p. 113, n. 4. The third chapter of Elster's book offers a critique of structuralism.

7. F. A. Hayek, "The Pretence of Knowledge" (Nobel memorial lecture, 1974), in his *New Studies in Philosophy, Politics, Economics, and the History of Ideas* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1978), p. 32.

۸. در مقابل در یک سیستم خطی، حساسیت یک متغیر وابسته، به تغییرات یک متغیر مستقل ثابت است. البته تغییرات کوچک در قالب «اختلالات جزئی» - واژه مورد علاقه متخصصین آمار برای اشاره به رویدادهای غیرمترقبه، نقص داده، و جهل ساده - تطبیق داده می‌شوند.

۹- نظریاتی هستند که قابلیت پیش‌بینی‌شان بهتر از توانایی توصیف آنها است. به‌عنوان مثال نظریه زمین‌محوری [بطلمیوس] در پیش‌بینی حرکت ستارگان کاملاً موفق بود، اما با معیارهای نوین، توصیفات آن بسیار ناکافی هستند. نگاه کنید به:

Thomas S. Kuhn, *The Copernican Revolution: Planetary Astronomy in the Development of Western Thought* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1957).

10. See, for example, John Dunn, *Modern Revolutions: An Introduction to the Analysis of a Political Phenomenon*, 2nd ed. (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1989), pp. 2-3; and Valerie Bunce, "Democracy, Stalinism, and the Management of Uncertainty," in *Democracy and Political Transformation: Theories and East-Central European Realities*, ed. Gyorgy Szoboszlai (Budapest: Hungarian Political Science Association, 1991), especially pp. 152-153.
11. A similar point is developed by Nancy Bermeo, "Surprise, Surprise: Lessons from 1989 and 1991," in *Liberalization and Democratization: Change in the Soviet Union and Eastern Europe*, ed. Bermeo (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1992), pp. 184-187.
12. Carr, *What Is History?*, pp. 90-91.
13. Imre Lakatos, "Falsification and the Methodology of Scientific Research Programmes" (1970), in his *The Methodology of Scientific Research Programmes* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1978), pp. 8-101.
14. Leo Strauss, *Persecution and the Art of Writing* (Glencoe, Ill.: Free Press, 1952); and Muhsin Mahdi, *Ibn Khaldun's Philosophy of History* (London: George Allen and Unwin, 1957), especially pp. 113-125.
15. James C. Scott, *Weapons of the Weak: Everyday Forms of Peasant Resistance* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1985). See also Scott, *Domination and the Arts of Resistance: Hidden Transcripts* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1990).
16. Elisabeth Noelle-Neumann, *The Spiral of Silence-Our Social Skin* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1984; first German ed., 1980), pp. 55-56.
17. Peter Miller, "Which Side Are You On? The 1990 Nicaraguan Poll Debate," *Public Opinion Quarterly*, 55 (Summer 1991): 281-302. See also Stephen Schwartz, *A Strange Silence: The Emergence of Democracy in Nicaragua* (San Francisco: ICS Press, 1992), especially chaps. 4, 7.
18. Mark A. Uhlig, "Nicaraguan Opposition Rout Sandinistas; U.S. Pledges Aid, Tied to Orderly Turnover," *New York Times*, February 27, 1990, pp. A1, 12; and Norman Ornstein, "Why Polls Flopped in Nicaragua," *New York Times*, March 7, 1990, p. A25.
19. Katherine Bischoff and Howard Schuman, "Pens and Polls in Nicaragua: An Analysis of the 1990 Preelection Surveys," *American Journal of Political Science*, 36 (May 1992): 331-350.



۲۰. برای مطالعه دیدگاه‌های بیشتر در خصوص آزمایش خودکار نگاه کنید به:

- William A. Barnes, "Rereading the Nicaraguan Pre-Election Polls in the Light of the Election Results," in *The 1990 Elections in Nicaragua and Their Aftermath*, ed. Vanessa Castro and Gary Prevost (Lanham, Md.: Rowman and Littlefield, 1992), pp. 41-128.
21. Karl R. Popper, *Conjectures and Refutations: The Growth of Scientific Knowledge* (New York: Basic Books, 1962).
22. Thomas S. Kuhn, *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions*, 2nd ed. (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1970; first ed., 1962).
23. Jack A. Goldstone, "Predicting Revolutions: Why We Could (and Should) Have Foreseen the Revolutions of 1989-1991 in the U.S.S.R. and Eastern Europe," *Contention*, 2 (Winter 1993): 127-152.